Meeting called by: Chair Cary Catalano  
Type of meeting: Meeting #8

Facilitator: Supervising Planner, Drew Wilson, City of Fresno  
Note taker: Executive Assistant Cherie Vick, Planning and Development, City of Fresno

Roll Call Time: 6:02 PM  
Begin Time: 6:00 PM

Attendees: See page 5

Late Attendees:

Minutes

Agenda item: Welcome & Roll Call  
Presenter: Chair Cary Catalano

Discussion:
Chair Cary Catalano took roll call and introduced two new committee member, Steve Brandau and Matt Smith. Project Manager Summer Cecil took roll call for the Subject Matter Experts. Chair Cary Catalano thanked for submitting questions in advance and housekeeping items.

Conclusions:

n/a

Action items  
Person responsible  
Deadline
✓ Recommendation: We need to acknowledge racial and socioeconomical injustices in these communities.  
Evanka Saunders/Grecia Elenes  

Agenda item: Staff Presentations and Committee Discussion  
Presenter: Supervising Planner Drew Wilson

Discussion:
Supervising Planner Drew Wilson of Planning and Development Department outlined the accomplishments for Chapter 10.

Conclusions:

n/a

Action items  
Person responsible  
Deadline
✓ Joe White's questions will be emailed to the Committee Implementation  
Supervising Planner Drew Wilson  
Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20

✓ Question: (Grecia Elenas) What is the percentage on voluntary abatement versus more extensive steps for example receivership?  
Erica Camarena, Chief Assistant City Attorney; Supervising Planner Drew Wilson  
Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action items</th>
<th>Person responsible</th>
<th>Deadline</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓ Question: (Grecia Elenas) How are we leveraging the Small Business Grant program and CARES dollars and other forms of assistance for small business especially the vulnerable business?</td>
<td>Supervising Planner Drew Wilson</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Question: (Public Henovia) Was working with mobile vendors, Business Tax didn’t have counter help that spoke Spanish nor where there multiple language documents available.</td>
<td>Supervising Planner Drew Wilson</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Question: (Mariah Thompson) Of the City’s implemented policies in food desert areas that lead to more new groceries stores versus liquor stores and where are they located?</td>
<td>Supervision Planner Drew Wilson/ Assistant Director Dan Zack</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Question: (Daniel Brannick) What is an example of a healthy food grocer vs a normal grocer? What are the advantages/incentives for a healthy food grocer?</td>
<td>Supervising Planner Drew Wilson/ Assistant Director Dan Zack</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Question: (Grecia Elenas) How are is the City of Fresno incentivizing/encourage desert areas for farmer’s markets?</td>
<td>Supervising Planner Drew Wilson</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Motion: (Mariah Thompson/Grecia Elenas, second) Recommend additional options for fresh food options for desert communities.</td>
<td>Chairperson Cary Castalano/ Supervising Planner Drew Wilson</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Motion: (Mariah Thompson/Grecia Elenas, second) Explore option to expand lead testing programs, more proactive approach.</td>
<td>Chairperson Cary Castalano/ Supervising Planner Drew Wilson</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Request: (Mariah Thompson) A map of the where liquor stores are located in the City of Fresno.</td>
<td>Supervising Planner Drew Wilson</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Motion: (Grecia Elenas/Mariah Thompson, second) Recommend an acknowledgement regarding racial and socioeconomic injustices that have taken place in unhealthy communities.</td>
<td>Chairperson Cary Castalano/ Supervising Planner Drew Wilson</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Motion: (Grecia Elenas/Mariah Thompson, second) Recommend a policy on reparations for black Fresnoians, apologize and amend for enforcing discriminatory policies over decades that destroyed black communities and how the City of Fresno would move forward. (Local City Council Resolution?)</td>
<td>Chairperson Cary Castalano/ Supervising Planner Drew Wilson</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ Motion: (Grecia Elenas/Cary Castalano, second) Prohibiting heavy uses next to soft uses.</td>
<td>Chairperson Cary Castalano/ Supervising Planner Drew Wilson</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action items</td>
<td>Person responsible</td>
<td>Deadline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Motion: (Grecia Elenas/Mariah Thompson, second) Create an institutionalized process with the City of Fresno and Department of Public Health community on a climate change assessment when land use decisions are being made.</td>
<td>Chairperson Cary Castalano/Supervising Planner Drew Wilson</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Motion: (Grecia Elenas/Daniel Brannick, second) Include language to prioritize established neighborhoods and invest equitably.</td>
<td>Chairperson Cary Castalano/Supervising Planner Drew Wilson</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Motion: (Grecia Elenas/Mariah Thompson, second) Include language to identify incentives to target food desert communities.</td>
<td>Chairperson Cary Castalano/Supervising Planner Drew Wilson</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Motion: (Grecia Elenas/Mariah Thompson, second) Include language of alleyway beautification and working with communities.</td>
<td>Chairperson Cary Castalano/Supervising Planner Drew Wilson</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Motion: (Steve Brandau/Cary Castalano, second) Revisit Ag mitigation segment in the General Plan by the City Council, a lot has changed.</td>
<td>Chairperson Cary Castalano/Supervising Planner Drew Wilson</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Motion: (Daniel Brannick/Mariah Thompson, second) Update to include Cannabis ordinance as necessary.</td>
<td>Chairperson Cary Castalano/Supervising Planner Drew Wilson</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑ Motion: (Mariah Thompson/Grecia Elenas, second) City of Fresno to explore options creation of community kitchens for health food and vendors to have kitchens to prepared food.</td>
<td>Chairperson Cary Castalano/Supervising Planner Drew Wilson</td>
<td>Implementation Meeting, tentative, 9/1/20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Agenda item:** Next Meeting – August 4th, 2020 at 9:00AM  
**Presenter:** Chair Cary Catalano

**Discussion:**  
Cary Catalano, Committee Chair, thanked subject matter experts, staff and meeting was adjourned.

**Conclusions:**  
n/a

**Action items**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action items</th>
<th>Person responsible</th>
<th>Deadline</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☑ Chapter 5 – Parks, Open Space and Schools</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Meeting was adjourned by Chair Cary Catalano at 9:29PM.**

**Other Information**

**Observers:**  
Director Jennifer Clark, Planning and Development, City of Fresno  
Executive Assistant Cherie Vick, Planning and Development, City of Fresno  
Project Manager Summer Cecil, Planning and Development, City of Fresno
Resources:
Materials were passed out via email prior to all of the council member and subject matter experts.

Special notes:
Emailed motions and questions are included on pages 6 through 11.
## General Plan Implementation Review Committee Members

**Meeting Date:** 7/21/2020

| Appointing Auth. | Name             | Company                                      | Email                                         | In Attendance?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>District 1</td>
<td>Daniel Brannick</td>
<td>Odell Planning and Research</td>
<td><a href="mailto:daniel.brannick@gmail.com">daniel.brannick@gmail.com</a></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District 1</td>
<td>Mariah Thompson</td>
<td>Central Valley Chapter of the National Lawyers Guild</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Mariah.c.thompson@gmail.com">Mariah.c.thompson@gmail.com</a></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District 2</td>
<td>Sal Gonzales</td>
<td>Lance-Kashian Company</td>
<td><a href="mailto:sgonzales@lance-kashian.com">sgonzales@lance-kashian.com</a></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District 2</td>
<td>Gary Giannetta</td>
<td>Giannetta Engineering</td>
<td><a href="mailto:gary@giannettaengineering.com">gary@giannettaengineering.com</a></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District 3</td>
<td>Don Simmons</td>
<td>Lecturer, CSUF, Social Sciences College</td>
<td><a href="mailto:creativepotential@gmail.com">creativepotential@gmail.com</a></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District 3</td>
<td>Grecia Elenes</td>
<td>Leadership Counsel</td>
<td><a href="mailto:gelenes@leadershipcounsel.org">gelenes@leadershipcounsel.org</a></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District 4</td>
<td>Steve Brandau</td>
<td>County Supervisor</td>
<td><a href="mailto:sbrandau@fresnocityca.gov">sbrandau@fresnocityca.gov</a></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District 4</td>
<td>Jeff Roberts</td>
<td>The Assemi Group</td>
<td><a href="mailto:JRoberts@assemigroup.com">JRoberts@assemigroup.com</a></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District 5</td>
<td>Nick Yovino, Sr.</td>
<td>Retired Planning Director</td>
<td><a href="mailto:npyovino@gmail.com">npyovino@gmail.com</a></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District 5</td>
<td>Joe White</td>
<td>Jackson CDC</td>
<td><a href="mailto:joe@neighborhoodchurchfresno.com">joe@neighborhoodchurchfresno.com</a></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District 6</td>
<td>Matt Smith</td>
<td>Wathen-Castanos</td>
<td><a href="mailto:josh@wchomes.com">josh@wchomes.com</a></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District 6</td>
<td>Darius Assemi</td>
<td>Granville Homes</td>
<td><a href="mailto:DAssemi@gvhomes.com">DAssemi@gvhomes.com</a></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District 7</td>
<td>Patience Milrod</td>
<td>Central California Legal Services</td>
<td><a href="mailto:pmilrod@centralcallegal.org">pmilrod@centralcallegal.org</a></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District 7</td>
<td>Keith Bergthold</td>
<td>Fresno Metro Ministry</td>
<td><a href="mailto:keith@fresnometmin.org">keith@fresnometmin.org</a></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mayor</td>
<td>Lorraine Salazar</td>
<td>Sal's Mexican Restaurants</td>
<td><a href="mailto:slsmex@gmail.com">slsmex@gmail.com</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mayor</td>
<td>Cary Catalano</td>
<td>Catalano, Fenske &amp; Associates</td>
<td><a href="mailto:cary@cfanda.com">cary@cfanda.com</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mayor</td>
<td>Wayne Rutledge</td>
<td>Property Owner</td>
<td><a href="mailto:wayne@uhbagels.com">wayne@uhbagels.com</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Questions for Chapter 10: Healthy Communities - Grecia Elenes

1. P. 10-21 2007 Fresno Green Strategy encourages all city facilities to serve at least 20% locally grown and organic foods beginning with 2009. Q: Status on this?
2. Transportation improvement goals. Q: How do these goals align with other goals? (i.e. sb 743, CIP list, AT Plan, SB 1 $ distribution, etc.)
3. Q: Status of P. 10-28 comment to coordinate with community groups such as those in the BHC initiative?
4. Q: HC-1, how do we implement this? This is counter to what is actually happening and has happened in specific planning processes.
5. Q: HC-1-a, status? Alleyway clean ups ge little to no support that are coordinated by community leaders
6. Q: HC-2-a, status?
7. Q: HC-2-b, what’s happening to build more supportive housing?
8. Q: HC-2-c, how is this done in established neighborhoods where none to minimal investments/development would occur?
9. Q: HC-2-d, status update?
10. Q: HC-2-e, effectiveness of ATP in building out bike and ped networks equitably?
11. Q: HC-3-d,g, status update?
12. Q: HC-4-c, status update? How many units have been inspected?
13. Q: HC-4-e,f, status update?
14. Q: HC-5-a, status update? How is it that west Fresno still only has 1 grocery store?
15. Q: HC-8, status update on implementing policies?

Objective & Policy Recommendations

- **Recommendation**: we need to acknowledge the racial and socio-economic injustices that have taken place in these communities.
- **Recommendation**: Reparations for Black Fresnans. Develop a policy where the city apologizes and amends for decades of enforcing and implementing discriminatory policies that destroyed black communities. Policy will include reparations that would target City funding, time, and efforts to programs and priorities as identified by black Fresnans.
  - See [https://drive.google.com/file/d/1WKialVlISWzu72mhasyy9SslDbVGMSj5U/view](https://drive.google.com/file/d/1WKialVlISWzu72mhasyy9SslDbVGMSj5U/view) as example
- **HC-3-h** Engagement with the Department of Public Health and Community on Incompatible Land-Use Decisions. Prior to determining permits requesting rezone, conditional uses, expansion, etc. of heavy uses (i.e. IH, IL, RBP, and BP) in and around sensitive uses that include homes, schools, and religious institutions, the City shall engage the Fresno County Department of Public Health to determine whether an approval of such permit would result in negative health outcomes or exacerbate existing outcomes. Permit requests which result in an impact to the public’s health shall be consulted with the existing community and assess whether the impacts can be mitigated through community-identified solutions or whether the permit shall be denied.
  - HC-2-a — include in language to prioritize established neighbourhoods and invest equitably
  - HC-5-f — include language to target food deserts
  - HC-6-a — include language of alleyway beautification targeting those within quarter-mile of a school first
  - HC-7-c exacerbates inequities; should be removed
Questions for Chapter 10: Healthy Communities - Joe White

1. Given what we know about mental health, might we consider adoption a 5th key component that directly affects the health of the Fresno community? (in reference to page 10-2)

2. Do we have data/a map which speaks to specific health disparities based on where people live in the city?

3. On page 10-2, “Housing in the northern part of the city caters to upper-income families, while affordable housing investment has occurred in more distressed neighborhoods.” What about south east housing development and south west housing development?

4. Do we have a map of all the full-service grocery stores and produce markets in Fresno?

5. On page 10-22, “there is also a correlation between vehicle miles traveled and traffic collision rates.” Do we have data which explains if housing developments at the edge of the SOI increases/decreases VMT and therefore collision rates?

6. As per HC-1-a, should we include Fresno’s Community & Economic Development Partnership (CEDP) into this language? This is a cohort of resident-led, community development organizations, working together to build and strengthen a viable pipeline for resources to be delivered at a neighborhood scale in historically marginalized neighborhoods.

7. As per HC-5-a, does this happen?

8. As per HC-5-f, “Make publicly available an inventory of City-owned surplus land that could be use for urban agriculture”. Where can we find this?

9. As per HC-6-c, what progress has been made?
To: General Plan Implementation Committee  
From: Mariah Thompson, Committee Member  
Date: July 20, 2020  
Re: Chapter 10: Healthy Communities

I. Comments on Accomplishments In Presentation:

It would be useful to provide numbers and data for these accomplishments: how many enrolled in each program, what communities does they serve, what are the outcomes, how are the outcomes measured?

HC-1
  - “The Police Work In Communities in a Variety of Ways”- HC-1-a
City of Fresno residents, including youth, in communities most lacking in public services, employment opportunities, parks, amenities, high quality education, healthy food resources, and equitable transportation, and which have the highest levels of police involvement have consistently stated that policing in their communities has led to disproportionate criminalization of communities of color, and that the presence of police does not necessarily make people feel safer. Police presence in communities and schools should not be considered evidence of community health.

Police presence at schools leads to increased criminalization of normal youth behavior with lifelong negative consequences on vulnerable communities. Police-led “trauma informed” interventions are not appropriate in communities where the police are a source of trauma for many families.

HC-2
  - What percentage of transit development projects have occurred in each City zip code?
  - What is the Brownfields Grant that the City is involved in, what is the City’s role in the coalition with CFHL, and what does the grant do? What work has been accomplished on the grant since the GP was implemented? Is this program a result of the GP or does it predate this GP?
  - How has the City implemented the ESG and HOPWA funds? What accomplishments have come out of those allocations since the GP was approved? How many people have been served?
  - What is Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design—what does this actually entail in terms of design? Does this include anti-homeless infrastructure incorporated into designs?
  - “The Police Department has Crime Prevention officers to address areas of vulnerability on existing residences and businesses (HC-2-c): see previous comments on policing not being a sign of healthy communities.
  - Police Review of CUP and ABC permits (HC-2-c): The City has stated that it does not have a method of tracking or evaluating the concentration of liquor stores in various communities in Fresno. When the City is deciding whether to grant a new liquor license, it therefore is unable to determine whether granting the license would contribute to a high concentration of liquor stores in a particular community.
  - The City should implement policies that affirmatively seek to increase stores with fresh produce and decrease the presence of liquor stores. Rather than focus on how to best police liquor stores, the City should not approve so many liquor stores in poor neighborhoods. This is a discretionary issue. (HC-2-c)
What projects has the ATP brought to low-income communities since the GP was adopted? (HC-2-d, HC-2-e)

What is the Safer Routes to School Resolution? (HC-2-d, HC-2-e)

What is the City’s BPAC (HC-2-e)

Anti-slumlord Enforcement Team (HC-4-c): Why were only 53 cases prosecuted if 26,283 violations to date?

Reactive Rental Housing: How are cases resolved and closed?

How many new grocery stores have been constructed since the implementation of the General Plan? Where are they located?

What is the concentration of liquor stores vs. grocery stores in Fresno by zip code?

Have these policies eliminated food deserts in any parts of the City?

What is the Community Health Improvement Plan’s Food Insecurity Workgroup and what accomplishments has it achieved?

The goal of this section is to increase access to schools and their services for their community. Yet approximately half of the accomplishments cited by the City are simply the presence of law enforcement on campuses. Law enforcement on campuses is not typically seen by communities as an indication of increased opportunity, amenities, or investment in the health of a community. The City should not rely on law enforcement actions to meet policy goals, especially related to schools and children.

How many new parks have been created?

How much new acreage of park space has been created and where?

This section appears to indicate that there has not been movement on parks beyond planning work.

Why only partnerships with the Youth Leadership Institute?

What other youth-based organizations does the City work with, and how?

How does the City promote youth mental health and substance use programs?

II. Comments and Questions on Chapter Text

Overall:

The policies, including implementation policies, lack measurable objectives and affirmative commitments. There is a heavy reliance on words such as saying the City will “promote”, “support” “publicize” and “consider development of” polices and plans. These are not firm commitments from the City and do not create explicit tasks and timelines.

Pg. 10-28- Building Healthy Communities Initiative

This is the only part of this chapter that explicitly states the importance of recognizing historic and ongoing bias in the creation of divested areas of the City.

This section also actively promotes investment in the most vulnerable and marginalized areas of Fresno.

Yet the City explicitly states that these matters are not policies of the plan, but the City simply “coordinates with” groups such as BHC. The City must affirmatively
recognize the need for concentrated investment in underserved communities, with an eye towards racial and economic equity, in its General Plan policies.

- **Transportation:**
  - Pg. 10-22—States that VMT reduction has multiple benefits and promotes VMT reduction. City simultaneously is opposing implementation of SB 743 VMT analysis in CEQA adaptation. These seem to be in conflict.

- **Healthy Food -HC-5**
  - HC-5-e- What is the implementation status of this? What does the Food Policy Council do? Who is on it?
  - HC-5-f: Urban agriculture:
    - Is there a publicly available inventory of City-owned surplus land to be used for urban agriculture?
    - Have any new urban agriculture projects been started since implementation of the GP?

- **Housing**
  - Pg. 10-26 states: “The relatively low cost of land and ample supply of housing in the area also means that the market generally provides a supply of affordable housing on its own.”
    - This statement is inaccurate and minimizes the severe lack of affordable housing in Fresno. It is unclear on what basis the City makes this statement—evidence consistently shows that Fresno has a severe shortage of affordable housing, especially for very-low and low-income residents.
    - A recent study indicated that Fresno County is in need of up to 41,000 affordable housing units. The housing voucher wait list is currently several years. The City is consistently ranked as one of the most housing-burdened areas, with high levels of substandard housing, concentrated areas of poverty, and homelessness.
    - The reliance of “ample land” for housing development also promotes a sprawl development policy, rather than encouraging infill development strategies that other sections of the General Plan promote. This creates an internal inconsistency within the General Plan.
  - How many low and very-low income housing units have been built since the implementation of the General Plan? What is the RHNA shortage on low and very-low income housing?
  - What is the current projected need for low-income and very-low income housing?

- **Youth Development: H-8**
  - The City’s goals of “promoting the public image” of the City’s youth development approach and “promote broad based support” are not goals that are measures of the effectiveness of programming in supporting youth—this makes it sound more like the City is interested in PR. (HC-8-a)
  - What does “broad-based” support mean? (HC-8-a)
  - What is the status of the Youth Master Plan (HC-8-d)
  - Please provide more detail on the “expanded youth job development partnership” from HC-8-c and what the status is.
The City should be working with local youth-centered organizations, beyond YLI, to support trauma-informed care, including mental health and substance use care, for youth.

The City should not promote police presence on campuses. This leads to the criminalization of youth, promotes the school-to-prison pipeline, and creates fear for youth.

The City must recognize that for many system-impacted communities and youth, the police are a form of trauma and their presence is not considered a sign or promotion of “healthy communities”

The City must prioritize supporting youth in the communities that are most divested from—those with generational trauma and poverty, black and brown communities, communities most impacted by the war on drugs and war on gangs.

The City should have youth-development professionals, such as Fresno Barrios Unidos, provide evaluation of and input on City General Plan policies related to youth.

The City must ask youth what services youth desire.