

**CITY OF FRESNO**

**TRANSPARENCY IN CITY GOVERNMENT ACT**



The following policies are enacted to help improve and enhance transparency in City of Fresno government operations by providing disclosure of City employees and elected officials' compensation.

EXHIBIT "A" TO RESOLUTION

**ARTICLE I  
DEFINITIONS**

**Base Salary**

The base salary is the defined salary of an Employee or Elected Official as set forth in either the annually approved City salary resolution or by a negotiated contract between the City and an Employee or Official.

**Benchmark or Peer Cities**

Benchmark or peer cities represent those cities in California that are comparable population-wise and demographically to Fresno.

**Consultants**

Professional service providers, individuals or entities, who are not employed by the City of Fresno.

**Elected Officials**

The Mayor and City Council members.

**Employees**

**All part-time and full-time City employees including Executive Employees.**

**Evergreen Provision**

A contract provision that automatically renews the length of the agreement after a predetermined period, unless notice for termination is given. Evergreens are often used for long-term agreements such as memberships or maintenance contracts.

**Executive Employees**

Executive level Employees who are unclassified, "at will" department head and above management positions.

**Gross Wages**

An employee's pre-tax compensation including all normal salary/hourly earnings, bonuses, overtime, deferred compensation, leave payoff/administrative leave, car allowance, and pay deferral.

**Municipal Code Section 4-107 (b)**

Municipal Code Section 4-107 (b) provides that except for legal services, the City Manager is authorized to contract for all services required by the City for which an appropriation has been made; provided the contract involves an expenditure of City moneys of less than or equal to fifty thousand dollars (\$50,000).

## EXHIBIT "A" TO RESOLUTION

### **Professional Services**

Professional services are infrequent, technical or unique functions provided by independent contractors or consultants whose occupation is the rendering of professional services.

### **Request for Proposal**

A Request for Proposal (RFP) is a solicitation initiated by the City to provide a competitive process for selecting professional Consultants, and establishing terms and conditions thereof.

## **ARTICLE II PURPOSE OF ACT**

Recent revelations in the City of Bell, California, have brought attention to the compensation of public officials. In a time of declining revenues and decreasing budgets it is important for the City to demonstrate fiscal responsibility. Salaries, benefits and pension costs represent over 80% of the costs of the City General Fund. The public has a right to know compensation levels for all City Employees. It is imperative that the City of Fresno takes the lead in providing full disclosure of compensation of its Employees including executive public officials, and Elected Officials. The purpose of this Act is to create an easy to find, readily available means to view current Employees and Elected Officials' compensation levels. It is also important to compare the compensation levels of City Executive and Elected Officials with officials from our peer cities in California.

Objectives of Act:

1. To provide annual disclosure of City of Fresno Employees, Consultants and Elected Officials' compensation.
2. To provide a comparative analysis of compensation levels for executive employees and elected officials in peer cities in California.
3. To implement enabling legislation (i.e., Fresno Municipal Code Section 3-124) via a municipal resolution to establish necessary policies.

## **ARTICLE III CITY ELECTED OFFICIALS AND EMPLOYEE EARNINGS DISCLOSURE**

It shall be the practice of the City of Fresno to provide: 1) a list of total earnings of all City Employees in Gross Wages as reported on the year end W-2 form and 2) a

## EXHIBIT "A" TO RESOLUTION

separate list of total earnings of all Elected Officials and all Executive Employees in Gross Wages as reported on the year end W-2 form. Both lists shall be in an easy to find location at the City web site, and printed lists at the City Clerk's office. The list shall be updated annually to the City web site as part of the Mayor's annual proposed budget.

The earnings disclosure for all Employees, except for the City Manager, Assistant City Manager and department heads, will be listed by occupation/title only. It will not include individual Employee names and will only list those Employees who have been in the City's employment for 12 months or longer except for Executive Employees. If an Executive Employee has been employed for less than 12 months then the Gross Wages compensation shall be computed based on earnings to date and projected for an annual figure.

A description of health and retirement benefits by bargaining unit and for unrepresented Employees will also be provided along with the earnings disclosure. Copies of employment contracts for the City Manager and Assistant City Manager will be posted to the City web site and available at the City Clerk's Office.

### **ARTICLE IV CONSULTANT DISCLOSURE**

The total annual compensation paid to any Consultant providing Professional Services for the City shall be disclosed including those Consultants making less than \$50,000 per year. A report will be prepared by the City Manager detailing the following information:

1. The name of the Consultant;
2. A description of the Professional Services provided; and
3. A detailed account of all payments by the City to the Consultant including the total paid for the fiscal year.

### **ARTICLE V SCOPE OF EARNINGS FOR CITY EMPLOYEES AND ELECTED OFFICIALS**

Total earnings is defined as all taxable earnings (i.e. Gross Wages as reported on W-2 forms), which includes base salary/hourly wages; performance bonuses (unclassified employees only); overtime; leave payoff/administrative leave; deferred compensation; car allowance; and any pay differentials.

## EXHIBIT "A" TO RESOLUTION

The reporting of earnings for all classified employees shall specify using the following categories: the base salary/hourly wages; over-time wages; all other benefits (i.e. leave payoff, pay differential) combined; and the total earnings of the employee.

A description of health and retirement benefits by bargaining unit and for unrepresented employees will also be provided along with the earnings disclosure. Copies of employment contracts for the City Manager and Assistant City Manager will be posted to the City web site and available at the City Clerk's Office.

### **ARTICLE VI BENCHMARK CITIES EXECUTIVE EMPLOYEE COMPENSATION MATRIX**

The compensation of executive employees for the Benchmark Cities in California shall be presented in a side-by-side comparison matrix. The following executive positions shall be included in the peer city comparison: City Manager; Assistant City Manager; City Attorney; City Clerk; City Controller/Treasurer; Police Chief and Fire Chief. This matrix will detail comparable executive city positions showing the compensation levels. Compensation displayed will include base salaries and, when information is available, other types of compensation (e.g. performance bonuses). Because of the inherent difficulty in obtaining data on any additional compensation it may be difficult to disclose full compensation figures for defined executive positions from other peer cities.

If any future comparisons of any other Employee classification become necessary in the discretion of City Council, the same Benchmark Cities shall be used.

This matrix shall be updated every year to reflect current population statistics and compensation levels. Please see Exhibit 'A' to this Act for sample matrix.

### **ARTICLE VII BENCHMARK CITIES ELECTED OFFICIALS COMPENSATION MATRIX**

The compensation for elected officials of the Benchmark Cities in California shall be presented in a side-by-side comparison matrix. The matrix will detail comparable elected officials' compensation levels. This matrix display shall be updated every year to reflect current population statistics and compensation levels. Please see Exhibit 'B' to this Act for sample matrix.

### **ARTICLE VIII ANNUAL COMPENSATION DISCLOSURE REPORT**

EXHIBIT "A" TO RESOLUTION

Once a year, during the annual budget hearings, the City Manager will make a presentation to the Council and provide a written report to the Council members outlining all of the reporting described in Articles III, IV, V, VI and VII.

**ARTICLE IX  
EXTENDED NOTICE FOR CONTRACTS WITH CONTINUOUS ("EVERGREEN")  
PROVISIONS**

The City Council shall be provided seven business days prior notice of the effective date of any Employee contract containing an evergreen provision and a base salary of \$100,000 per year or more. .

**ARTICLE X  
TRANSPARENCY**

All information and reports described in this Act shall be available for public viewing at an easy to find identified link titled, "City Elected Officials and Employee Earnings Disclosure" at the City's Home Page website. Hard copies shall also be available to members of the public for viewing or pickup at the City Clerk's office during regularly scheduled business hours.

**ARTICLE XI  
ONE-YEAR REVIEW**

One year from the effective date of this Act, the Council shall, at a regularly scheduled meeting, review the implementation and practice of this Act and, if necessary, amend the Act to reflect required changes.

Attachments: Exhibit A: Sample Matrix- Executive Employees  
Exhibit B: Sample Matrix-Elected Officials

**EXHIBIT 'A'**  
**CALIFORNIA BENCHMARK CITIES COMPARATIVE EXECUTIVE COMPENSATION**  
**SURVEY CONDUCTED JULY, 2010**

<b>CITY MANAGER</b>	
Agency	Base Salary
Fresno	\$189,000
Anaheim	\$261,891
Bakersfield	\$222,154
Long Beach	\$235,000
Oakland	\$238,334
Riverside	\$275,000
Sacramento	\$215,000
San Diego	\$250,860
San Jose	\$250,000
Santa Ana	\$245,772
Stockton	\$200,000+

Average Salary | \$238,301

<b>ASSISTANT CITY MANAGER</b>	
Agency	Base Salary
Fresno	\$162,804
Anaheim	\$238,686
Bakersfield	\$135,312
Long Beach	\$217,499
Oakland	\$216,667
Riverside	\$196,104
Sacramento	Not Reported
San Diego	\$185,640
San Jose	\$236,550
Santa Ana	\$129,684-\$183,240
Stockton	Not reported

1 Average Salary | \$198,658

<b>POLICE CHIEF</b>	
Agency	Base Salary
Fresno	\$169,701
Anaheim	\$226,615
Bakersfield	\$172,152
Long Beach	\$219,911
Oakland	\$195,343
Riverside	\$241,020
Sacramento	\$192,459
San Diego	\$177,060
San Jose	\$221,652
Santa Ana	\$245,772
Stockton	\$174,120

2 Average Salary | \$203,255

<b>POPULATION STATISTICS</b>	
Agency	Population
Fresno	505,679
Anaheim	348,467
Bakersfield	338,952
Long Beach	492,682
Oakland	404,155
Riverside	300,430
Sacramento	463,794
San Diego	1,279,329
San Jose	948,976
Santa Ana	355,662
Stockton	322,462

- Notes: 1. Average salary excludes Stockton  
2. Average salary excludes Sacramento, Santa Ana, and Stockton  
3. Average salary based upon all 11 cities  
4. Population data based upon 2009-2010 estimates

<b>CITY ATTORNEY</b>	
Agency	Base Salary
Fresno	\$ 175,680
Anaheim	\$ 254,194
Bakersfield	\$ 179,628
Long Beach	\$ 235,176
Oakland	\$ 207,565
Riverside	\$ 212,844
Sacramento	\$ 188,999
San Diego	\$ 193,648
San Jose	\$ 231,599
Santa Ana	\$ 213,732
Stockton	\$ 198,708

Average Salary | \$ 208,343

<b>CITY CLERK</b>	
Agency	Base Salary
Fresno	
Anaheim	
Bakersfield	
Long Beach	
Oakland	
Riverside	
Sacramento	
San Diego	
San Jose	
Santa Ana	
Stockton	

Average Salary |

<b>CITY CONTROLLER</b>	
Agency	Base Salary
Fresno	
Anaheim	
Bakersfield	
Long Beach	
Oakland	
Riverside	
Sacramento	
San Diego	
San Jose	
Santa Ana	
Stockton	

Average Salary |

<b>FIRE CHIEF</b>	
Agency	Base Salary
Fresno	
Anaheim	
Bakersfield	
Long Beach	
Oakland	
Riverside	
Sacramento	
San Diego	
San Jose	
Santa Ana	
Stockton	

Average Salary |

**EXHIBIT 'B'**

**CALIFORNIA BENCHMARK CITIES COMPARATIVE ELECTED OFFICIALS  
COMPENSATION SURVEY CONDUCTED JULY, 2010**

City	2009-2010 Population	Mayor	City Council	No. Council Members	Notes
Fresno	505,679	\$130,000	\$65,000	7	
Anaheim	348,467			4	Meets twice a month
Bakersfield	338,952				
Long Beach	492,682			9	
Oakland	404,155			7	
Riverside	300,430				
Sacramento	463,794			8	
San Diego	1,279,329			8	
San Jose	948,976			10	
Santa Ana	355,662			6	Meets twice a month
Stockton	322,462				