RECEIVED

2014 OCT 6 PM 3 28

CITY CLERK, FRESNO CA

Agenda Item: ID#14-361 (2-A)
Date: 10/9/14

FRESNO CITY COUNCIL

City of FRESNO

Supplemental Information Packet

Agenda Related Items – ID#14-361 (2-A)
Supplemental Packet Date: October 6, 2014

Item(s)

Approve the selection of, and award a contract to, Republic Parking Inc. to provide Parking Facilities Management Services in downtown Fresno - Development and Resource Management Department

Supplemental Information:

Any agenda related public documents received and distributed to a majority of the City Council after the Agenda Packet is printed are included in Supplemental Packets. Supplemental Packets are produced as needed. The Supplemental Packet is available for public inspection in the City Clerk's Office, 2600 Fresno Street, during normal business hours (main location pursuant to the Brown Act, G.C. 54957.5(2). In addition, Supplemental Packets are available for public review at the City Council meeting in the City Council Chambers, 2600 Fresno Street. Supplemental Packets are also available on-line on the City Clerk's website.

Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA):

The meeting room is accessible to the physically disabled, and the services of a translator can be made available. Requests for additional accommodations for the disabled, sign language interpreters, assistive listening devices, or translators should be made one week prior to the meeting. Please call City Clerk's Office at 621-7650. Please keep the doorways, aisles and wheelchair seating areas open and accessible. If you need assistance with seating because of a disability, please see Security.

ID# 14-361
(2A)
10/9/14

Robert M. Dowd*
Robert W. Gin*
Randy L. Edwards
Jim D. Lee
Jeffrey L. Levinson*
Raymond L. Carlson
Ty N. Mizote*
Michael R. Johnson*
Mario U. Zamora
Janae D. Lopes
Melissa E. Webb

*a Professional Corporation

GRISWOLD LASALLE
Cobb Dowd & Gin LLP

Lyman D. Griswold
(1914-2000)

Michael E. LaSalle
(Retired)

Steven W. Cobb
(1947-1993)

ATTORNEYS
A California Limited Liability Partnership including Professional Corporations
111 E. SEVENTH STREET
HANFORD, CA 93230

Telephone: (559) 584-6656
www.griswoldlasalle.com

dowd@griswoldlasalle.com
Direct Fax: 800-947-0468

RECEIVED
2014 OCT 6 PM 2 48
CITY CLERK, FRESNO CA

October 6, 2014

VIA HAND DELIVERY

Blong Xiong, Councilmember, District 1
Steve Brandau, Councilmember, District 2
Oliver L. Baines, III, Councilmember, District 3
Paul Caprioglio, Councilmember, District 4
Sal Quintero, Councilmember, District 5
Lee Brand, Councilmember, District 6
Clinton J. Olivier, Councilmember, District 7
c/o Yvonne Spence, City Clerk
CITY OF FRESNO
2600 Fresno Street, Room 2133
Fresno, CA 93721

Re: Council Agenda October 9, 2014,
Agenda Item ID# 14-361

Dear Honorable Councilmembers:

We come before you on behalf of Ace Parking Management Inc. (Ace).

We request that the City Council not award the Parking Facilities Management Contract to Republic Parking Inc. (Republic) as recommended by Staff.

Not all proposals were responsive to the City's Request for Proposals (RFP). Therefore, we suggest that the Council eliminate all non-complying proposals and reevaluate the responsive ones. There is time. The City has asked bidders to allow bids to stand through November 5, 2014 (see Attachment 1); and if that is insufficient time for the City to thoroughly and objectively review the proposals, I am sure the bidders would extend further.

Why do we request such action? Because Republic did not comply with the terms of the RFP and such non-compliance will harm the City.

The Parking Management Services RFP Selection Review Committee (Committee) found Pro Park non-responsive because it did not complete its bid proposal page (see Attachment 2); the staff report identifies Pro Park's proposed cost figure as "Not Included." Republic's proposal was, however, found to be responsive even though it failed to address the requirements of Addendum 5----a very expensive element of the bid. What was called for by Addendum 5? All bidders were directed to bid two fulltime daily employees for Woodward Park entry points and one more employee during major events; two fulltime daily employees for Roeding Park entry points; and one employee for the Sports Complex entry point during major events. Ace did and Republic did not. We raised these issues to City Manager Rudd and Purchasing Manager Watahira by writing of September 12 of this year and provided hereto as Attachment 3 is a copy of those papers.

The failure by Republic to address the staffing requirements of Addendum 5 means that Republic's payroll and payroll tax figures, two of the most significant line item expenses in Republic's proposed annual operating budget, are inaccurate. If Republic had included the required staffing for the parks, its proposal would increase by $400,000 per year, making Republic's bid the second most expensive received by the City.

The staff report indicates that one reason Ace is not the recommended candidate is because of the cost of its proposed services. Ace's proposal would have included a lower cost component if it omitted required services like Republic's bid. Instead, Ace followed the instructions set forth in the RFP and included ***all*** of the requested information in its proposal.

The Committee involved in the selection process noted that Ace is qualified, but also dismissed our proposal in part due to "unresolved complaints" (see Attachment 2). Ace is unfamiliar with such "unresolved complaints" as the City failed to bring them to Ace's attention during the nearly ten year period during which Ace has worked for the City. In light of the City's silence over the years, it came as a surprise that the Committee found that the "unresolved complaints" justified Ace's elimination as a candidate after the first round of review.

Why do we do an RFP? Generally speaking, an RFP is used so the City can solicit proposals for goods and services that address the City's needs. Everyone is to bid the same goods and services so the City can compare apples-to-apples and receive the best product for a reasonable price. This has not occurred.

Neither the City's nor the public's interests are served by awarding a contract based upon a bid that fails to address significant RFP requirements, which is why Pro Park was eliminated after the Committee's first round of review. Republic's proposal is similarly deficient.

It is further noted the RFP places emphasis on the integration of parking facilities operations with Downtown revitalization efforts. The RFP's Scope of Work identifies one component of that effort as: "Continually strive to increase customer satisfaction and City revenue in the parking facilities, within the given rate structure." We agree with both. The question is how do you achieve such goal?

Republic's proposal relies heavily on payment systems/machines, which illustrates Republic's unfamiliarity with the demographics of Downtown patrons. In order for Downtown revitalization to be successful, patrons must be accommodated rather than subjected to conditions that would make their Downtown experience unpleasant. Ace is most aware of the Downtown patrons because Ace has been a partner with Fresno for many years, focusing on Downtown.

We encourage the Council to eliminate those proposals that are non-responsive or which may be inconsistent with the goals stated in the RFP. Millions of dollars of public funds will be paid to the company that is awarded the Parking Facilities Management Contract. A fair RFP process, including the consistent and objective review of proposals, should be utilized to identify the contractor that will provide the best services at the best price, which will result in the sound use of the public's funds. We encourage the Council to utilize a third party consultant to review the proposals and to identify those that are non-responsive and to rank the responsive bids as the process that has occurred to date suffers from glaring deficiencies. The Council should have a full and accurate assessment of the proposals when awarding the Parking Facilities Management Contact.

Without a fair RFP process, the citizens of Fresno cannot be ensured to have the best service for the best price, by the most qualified group. We believe that the citizens deserve the best and believe that each of you believe that as well. If the contract is awarded to a group who has failed to comply with the basic requirements of the RFP, the citizens will undoubtedly suffer.

Sincerely,
GRISWOLD, LaSALLE, COBB,
DOWD & GIN, LLP

By: _____
ROBERT M. DOWD

RMD/sr
Attachments
cc: (with attachments)
Ashley Swearengin, Mayor
Bruce Rudd, City Manager
Douglas Sloan, City Attorney
Jennifer Clark, Director, Development and Resource Management Department
Del Estabrooke, Parking Manager, Parking Services Division

ATTACHMENT 1

City of
FRESNO

Purchasing Division - (559) 621-1332 - FAX (559) 488-1069 - www.fresno.gov
2600 Fresno St, Rm 2156
Fresno CA 93721

Finance Department
Karen Bradley
Assistant Controller

October 1, 2014

VIA FACSIMILE

ACE PARKING MANAGEMENT INC.
555 MONTGOMERY STREET SUITE 1150
SAN FRANCISCO CA 94111

ATTENTION: JOHN BAUMGARDNER

SUBJECT REQUEST FOR EXTENSION OF BID PROPOSAL
FOR: RFP FOR PARKING FACILITIES MANAGEMENT SERVICES
(BID FILE NO.) 9261

The City is currently evaluating the bid proposals for the above project. However, the City will not be able to make an award within the time frame allowed by the bid specifications. The City requests that your company extend your bid proposal through November 5, 2014.

Please indicate below if you are able or unable to comply with the extension request. **Return your signed response to this office no later the 5:00 PM, Thursday, October 2, 2014.** A fax copy is acceptable using fax number (559) 488-1069.

Bid deposits will continue to be held until a contract is awarded, or all bids are rejected.
There is no change in staff determination.

Sincerely,

Gary Watahira
Purchasing Manager

Please check the appropriate box:

[✓] Will extend bid/proposal

[ ] Will not extend bid/proposal

Signature of Authorized Individual

Name (Print)

Title Date

HP Officejet Pro 8600 N911a Series

Fax Log for
Ace Parking
16192330741
Oct 01 2014 4:32PM

Last Transaction

Date	Time	Type	Station ID	Duration	Pages	Result
				Digital Fax		
Oct 1	4:30PM	Fax Sent	15594881069	1:22 N/A	2	OK

ATTACHMENT 2

REPORT FROM EVALUATION COMMITTEE
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL FOR
PARKING MANAGEMENT SERVICES UTILITIES - RFP NO. 9261

COMMITTEE MEMBERS:

- Diana Reynolds, Buyer II/Facilitator, City of Fresno, Finance Department– Purchasing
- Rene Smith, Assistant City Manager, City of Fresno, Office of the mayor and City Manager's office
- Bob Koury, Principle Internal Auditor, City of Fresno, Finance Department
- Michael Lima, Management Analyst III , Airports Department, Airports Finance
- Craig Scharton, Fulton Mall Manager, Downtown Fresno Partnership
- Rick Roush, Downtown Fresno Partnership Board Member

BACKGROUND

The goal of this Request for Proposal (RFP) was to solicit proposals to provide professional public personnel to properly manage maintain and secure the parking facility and common areas on a daily basis. The Operator will be responsible for the employing and supervising personnel to perform contracted services

Proposals were submitted by the seven vendors according to the Request for Proposal April 8, 2014 deadline. Below is a summary of Proposals submitted by the seven vendors:

Vendor	$ Proposal
Republic Parking Systems	6,595,263.00
Ace Parking	8,322,380.00
Parking Concepts Inc.	4,645,009.00
LAZ Parking	3,884,614.00
ABM Parking	9,238,970.00
SP Plus Corp	6,066,056.00
Pro Park	9,238,970.00

COMMITTEE NOTES

Evaluation committee members were in agreement that all seven proposers, are capable of providing the Development Department/Parking with professional parking facilities management services. Therefore, the selection was based on the differences in the vendors' written proposals, presentations and interviews.

In the first committee meeting, Propark was determined to be non-responsive as they did not complete their bid proposal page. The incumbent was also dismissed due to current unresolved problems and complaints. The committee narrowed down their selection to four candidates Republic Parking

System, SP Plus Corporation, LAZ Parking and Parking Concepts Inc. The committee submitted requests for more information to LAZ Parking and Parking Concepts. From those results the committee came up with the top two candidates Republic Parking System and SP Plus Corporation and invited them to be interviewed.

The evaluation committee interviewed the top two candidates agreed that Republic Parking System will be able to provide the best value of the seven vendors based on their interview, overall experience, best fit for the downtown area and submitted proposal. The evaluation committee is impressed by Republic Parking System's professionalism and strong downtown support displayed during the interview process.

Although LAZ provided the lowest cost of the seven proposers, they were concerned that the technology focus was at the expense of customer service. The committee believes that Republic Parking System will provide more value based on experience and efficient handling of the downtown area.

Republic Parking System

Republic Parking System is one of the largest providers of parking management services across the United States that has been in business for the past 48 years. The committee unanimously agreed that Republic Parking System will provide the best value, particularly in terms of their ability to service the downtown area and work with the downtown partners. This was reflected in their proposal and subsequent interview which focused on customer service. The committee was particularly impressed with their solid grasp of the issues facing the downtown area and met all requirements of the RFP, their proposal, presentation and interview were professional and their references were checked and found to be satisfactory.

SP Plus Corporation

SP Plus Corporation has been in business since 1929 and is the result of the merger with Central Parking in 2012. Their proposal had a great parking plan but is still under some strain as a result of their merger. They didn't seem to have any downtown parking experience but met all requirements of the original RFP. Their references were checked and found to be satisfactory.

LAZ PARKING

LAZ Parking has just merged with Vinci Parking which made it unclear how much of the experience is LAZ and how much is Vinci. Their plan included a great deal of focus on automation which the committee felt was at the expense of customers. Their references were checked and found to be satisfactory.

PARKING CONCEPTS INC.

Parking Concepts Inc. (PCI) was formed in 1974 and is privately owned. Their proposal was satisfactory but was not as strong as others in the areas of experience and technology. Their financials were not strong and the committee speculates that PCI may not have the resources to adequately address our situation here in Fresno. Their references were checked and found to be satisfactory.

ABM PARKING SERVICES

ABM Parking Services provided a satisfactory proposal but the committee felt that nothing really stood out as exceptional. Their references were checked and found to be satisfactory.

ACE PARKING

Ace Parking is the current contract holder of the Parking Facilities Management Services. The committee felt that their presentation was weak and is not currently meeting the City's needs related to reporting, technology or customer service. Their references were checked and found to be satisfactory.

Pro Park

Pro Park was determined to be non-responsive. Their bid proposal page was not completed and the committee felt that they could not adequately evaluate their proposal.

RECOMMENDATION:
The committee unanimously agrees and reconfirms their findings that Republic Parking System will be able to provide the most effective and efficient professional Parking Facilities Management Services as well as the best value based on their proposal, interview, and strong team approach with the downtown area. Therefore, the committee recommends that Republic Parking Systems be awarded the Parking Facilities Services contract.

ATTACHMENT 3

our mission
By valuing our employees, listening to our clients, and operating under the ideals of moral integrity, quality and accountability, we will lead the parking industry in service and financial results for our clients.

Scott A. Jones
Chairman

Keith B. Jones
Managing Principal

John Baumgardner
Vice Chairman & CEO

Steve Burton
President

Founding Member of the National Parking Association

HAND DELIVERED

September 12, 2014

Mr. Bruce Rudd
City Manager
Office of the City Manager
2600 Fresno Street
Fresno, CA 93721-3602

RE: FORMAL PROTEST TO "NOTICE OF STAFF DETERMINATION OF CONTRACT AWARD" TO REPUBLIC PARKING SCHEDULE FOR AWARD ON SEPTEMBER 25, 2014. (RFP For Parking Facilities Management Services – No. 9261)

Dear Mr. Rudd,

Ace Parking Management Inc. hereby formally and legally notifies the City of Fresno that we respectively protest city staff's "NOTICE OF STAFF DETERMINATION OF CONTRACT AWARD," posted on August 14, 2014, recommending contract award to Republic Parking, which is tentatively agendized for the City Council Meeting of September 25, 2014.

Said protest is based on the City's non-compliance with the mandatory requirements as stipulated in the February 5, 2014 "RFP for Parking Facilities Management Services, Invitation #9261 and its Addendums 1 through 8, inclusive.

Accordingly, we are requesting the City of Fresno remove from the City Council Meeting of September 25, 2014, the award of contract to Republic Parking until all parties can determine the subsequent fair and legal protocol regarding the entire RFP process and its final disposition.

BACKGROUND

With the August 14, 2014, posting of "Notice of Staff Determination of Contract Award" (EXHIBIT 1), Ace Parking Management Inc. also received a facsimile from Purchasing Manager Gary Watahira, dated August 18, 2014, titled: "Request For Extension of Bid Proposal For: RFP For Parking Facilities

ace parking management, inc. 645 Ash Street San Diego, CA 92101 tel 619.233.6624 fax 619.233.0741 www.aceparking.com

Management Services - Bid File No. 9261" (EXHIBIT 2). Mr. Watahira's letter is clear in requesting the following:

> *"The City is currently evaluating the bid proposals for the above project. However, the City will not be able to make an award with the time frame allowed by the bid specifications. The City requests that your company extend your bid proposal through October 5, 2014."*

The City of Fresno issues an August 14, 2014 "Notice of Staff Determination of Contract Award" and, immediately thereafter, issues an August 18, 2014 public document extending the process to October 5, 2014. At this point, the RFP process became convoluted.

As a result, Ace Parking Management Inc. faxed to Mr. Watahira on August 21, 2014, our letter requesting clarification and a reply to our three questions (EXHIBIT 3). On August 21, 2014, at 12:32 PM, we did receive an immediate email response from Diana Reynolds, Buyer II, Purchasing Division, which she states:

> *"In response to your questions regarding the extension on the above. This only means that the bids have expired and that an extension is required to keep them current. You have five days prior to the award to submit an appeal if you choose to do so (emphasis added)."*

We immediately responded to Ms. Reynolds' email and stated:

> *"Thanks for the fast response to my fax. I still have the question – Does the August 14, 2014 posting still stand indicating that Republic Parking is tentatively to be awarded the contract at the September 25, 2014 Council meeting?"*

Seven (7) days passed and we did not receive any further response from the City of Fresno. Therefore, we faxed Ms. Reynolds our August 28, 2014, letter expressing our serious concerns with the RFP process. We copied you and Mr. Watahira on this letter (EXHIBIT 4).

Subsequently, Mr. Watahira called John Baumgardner, CEO & Vice Chairman, and asked what he was seeking. Mr. Baumgardner requested a response to Ace Parking Management Inc. written requests for information. Furthermore, if Republic Parking is being recommended for award, Mr. Baumgardner requested information regarding the RFP Evaluation Committee, the RFP evaluation process, evaluation documents, and a copy of Republic Parking's submitted RFP.

On September 4, 2014, Mr. Watahira did forward an incomplete copy of Republic Parking's RFP submittal to Ace Parking Management Inc. We recognize that elements of Republic Parking's RFP are proprietary; however, the following pages are missing: 10-11, 60-68, 67-70, 72-82, 84-92, and 102-125. The missing pages appear to be random in nature.

After reviewing Republic Parking's RFP submittal, we found it did not comply with the City of Fresno's stipulated RFP requirements and mandatory Addendums. These omissions produced a lower bid proposal from Republic Parking. Therefore, Ace Parking Management Inc. protests the RFP Evaluation Committee and staff's determination that Republic Parking is the "lowest responsible bidder."

UNDENIABLE FACTS SUBSTANTIATING PROTEST

By the City of Fresno's own admission of fact, as notice to all bidders, an addendum is "... made part of the above entitled specifications for the City of Fresno..." Addendum No. 5 was issued for "Parking Facilities Management Services Bid File Number: 9261" (EXHIBIT 5). Addendum No. 5 clearly mandates that all bid proposals shall now include three (3) parks, which shall include staffing for the specified hours of operations and number of entry points.

Furthermore, Addendum No. 5, "Requirements: 1 through 9" stipulates additional requirements and costs. Requirement #9 is specific in stating: "9. A separate Management through the addendum is established for this work."

A review of Republic Parking's RFP proposal indicates the proposal does not include the additional requirements and incurred costs of Addendum No. 5. There is no "... separate Management through the addendum established for this work." The following pages from Republic Parking's proposal underscore these points (EXHIBIT 6):

Republic Parking RFP Proposal	Observations
Page 23 of 125	No line item for parks cashiers or staffing.
Pages 30 to 32 of 125	Staffing Plan & Management/Office Schedule does not include required Park Supervisor.
Page 34 of 125	No cashier staffing for three (3) Parks.

Page 35 – 36 of 125 No Special Events staffing for three (3) Parks.

Republic Parking's RFP proposal has no "separate Management through addendum" and, therefore, there Bid Proposal does not include these costs.

These aforementioned facts are clear, undeniable, and consclusive based on the information provided to us by the City of Fresno.

REQUEST FOR INFORMATION UNDER THE FREEDOM OF INFORMATION ACT (FOIA)

Ace Parking Management Inc., under all applicable laws governing the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), is requesting the following information from the City of Fresno:

1. The Bid Ranking of all RFP proposals.
2. The composition of RFP Selection Committee, both Voting and Non-Voting members.
3. All materials used by the RFP Selection Committee for evaluation purposes (Blanks).
4. Instructions given to the RFP Selection Committee for evaluating.
5. All emails from RFP Selection Committee members sent to prospective Bidders, including responses.
6. The role of Non-Voting members.
7. The written criteria for selecting RFP Selection Committee members in addition to those listed in the RFP proposal.
8. The RFP Bid proposal documents for the top three ranked proposals.
9. If an oral interview was convened, the criteria for the oral board composition and qualifications. Furthermore, what criterion was used to invite bidders to the oral interviews, if such interviews were convened.
10. All Fresno Municipal Codes and Ordinances that provide support to Fresno businesses.

CLOSING OBSERVATIONS

We know the City of Fresno strives for the highest level of transparency. Mayor/CEO Ashley Swearingen has made this one of the cornerstones of her administration. Therefore, we would appreciate timely written correspondence from the City of Fresno that the September 25, 2014 City Council agenda item, which is scheduled to award the Parking Facilities Management Services contract to Republic Parking, is removed from the agenda. Until all information is made available and this matter is addressed by the City of Fresno, it would place an undue onus to bring this item forward to the City Council.

In accordance with the May 7, 2004 Ordinance No. 2004-41, which is also known as the "Regulated Communications in City Procurement Process Ordinance," we are communicating only directly with you and the Purchasing Manager by copying him on this letter. The gravity of this convoluted RFP process, the untimely and fragmented responses from the City's Purchasing Division, and the documented facts we have provided is significant justification to bring this to your direct attention as the City's Chief Administrative Officer.

We truly appreciate your efforts and staff efforts to address our protest and substantiated facts. We look forward to the City of Fresno responding to our requests under the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) so we may further analyze the RFP process.

Sincerely,

Steve Burton
President
Ace Parking Management Inc.

c: Mr. Gary Watahira, Purchasing Manager (HAND DELIVERED) City of Fresno Purchasing Division
John Baumgardner, Vice Chairman & C.E.O., Ace Parking Management, Inc.

Attachments: Exhibits 1 - 6

EXHIBIT 1

NOTICE OF STAFF DETERMINATION OF CONTRACT AWARD, POSTED: August 14, 2014

City of
FRESNO

Finance Department
Karen Bradley, Assistant Controller

Purchasing Division
2600 Fresno Street, Room 2156 - Fresno - California 93721-3622
(559) 621-1332 FAX (559) 488-1069

NOTICE OF STAFF DETERMINATION OF CONTRACT AWARD

Posted: August 14, 2014

Staff has determined the following to be the lowest responsible bidder(s) for the project(s) listed below.

Any bidder having a specific interest in the award of a contract may file an appeal of the staff determination of contract award in accordance with Resolution 2003-129. **Note**: Resolution 2003-129 does not apply to Request for Proposals, (RFP's), Request for Qualifications (RFQ's), or Request for Information (RFI), *unless specifically included in the specifications.*

Bid File	Project	To Be Awarded
	Council Meeting September 25, 2014	
9261	Request for Proposals for Parking Facilities Management Services ($6,595,263.00)	Republic Parking

EXHIBIT 2

"REQUEST FOR EXTENSION OF BID PROPOSAL", MR. GARY WATAHIRA, PURCHASING MANAGER, August 18, 2014 LETTER TO ALL RFP BIDDERS

City of
FRESNO
Purchasing Division - (559) 621-1332 - FAX (559) 488-1069 - www.fresno.gov
2600 Fresno St, Rm 2156
Fresno CA 93721

Finance Department
Karen Bradley
Assistant Controller

DATE August 18, 2014

VIA FACSIMILE

ACE PARKING MANAGEMENT INC.
555 MONTGOMERY STREET SUITE 1150
SAN FRANCISCO CA 94111

ATTENTION: JOHN BAUMGARDNER

SUBJECT REQUEST FOR EXTENSION OF BID PROPOSAL
FOR: RFP FOR PARKING FACILITIES MANAGEMENT SERVICES
(BID FILE NO.) 9261

The City is currently evaluating the bid proposals for the above project. However, the City will not be able to make an award within the time frame allowed by the bid specifications. The City requests that your company extend your bid proposal through October 5, 2014.

Please indicate below if you are able or unable to comply with the extension request. **Return your signed response to this office no later the 5:00 PM, Monday August 25, 2014.** A fax copy is acceptable using fax number (559) 488-1069.

If you are unable to comply with the extension request, your company will no longer be eligible for award of a contract for this project and your bid deposit will be refunded.

Bid deposits will continue to be held until a contract is awarded, or all bids are rejected. Bid bonds will not be returned unless requested in writing by the Bidder.

Sincerely,

Gary Watahira
Purchasing Manager

Please check the appropriate box:

[ ] Will extend bid/proposal

[ ] Will not extend bid/proposal

Signature of Authorized Individual

Name (Print)

Title Date

EXHIBIT 3

LETTER TO GARY WATAHIRA, PURCHASING MANAGER, FROM JOHN BAUMGARDNER, CEO & CHAIRMAN, ACE PARKING MANAGEMENT INC., DATED August 21, 2014.

our mission
By valuing our employees, listening to our clients, and operating under the ideals of moral integrity, quality and accountability, we will lead the parking industry in service and financial results for our clients.

Scott A. Jones
Chairman

Keith B. Jones
Managing Principal

John Baumgardner
Vice Chairman & CEO

Steve Burton
President

Founding Member of the National Parking Association

VIA FACSIMILE

August 21, 2014

Mr. Gary Watahira
Purchasing Manager
City of Fresno Purchasing Division
2600 Fresno Street
Room 2156
Fresno, California 93721

Dear Mr. Watahira,

Attached is Ace Parking Management, Inc.'s response to your August 18, 2014, letter regarding "Request for Extension of Bid Proposal for: RFP for Parking Facilities Management Services (BID FILE NO. 9261)."

Ace Parking Management, Inc. is enthusiastic and will remain competitive during the entire bid proposal evaluation. Therefore, our firm will extend our bid proposal through October 5, 2014. In the interest of fairness and clarity, we would also appreciate a response to our following questions:

1. Does your August 18, 2014 letter null-and-void and thus supersede the City of Fresno's website August 14, 2014 posting of: NOTICE OF STAFF DETERMNINATION OF CONTRACT AWARD" to Republic Parking with a Council meeting of September 25, 2014 (Attachment)? It would have too, correct?

2. Since the City of Fresno's August 14, 2014 posting does identify Republic Parking as the initial recommended bidder, which requires City Council approval, does this denote Republic Parking is no longer an applicant?

3. Since the Bid Proposal is extended to October 5, 2014, does this indicate that the City of Fresno will convene a separate oral board evaluation panel considering the magnitude and impact of this Bid Proposal?

Thank you for the opportunity for Ace Parking Management, Inc. to compete through October 5, 2014. We look forward to your timely written response to our questions. Please contact us at 619-233-6624 if we can be of assistance.

Sincerely,

John Baumgardner
C.E.O. & Vice Chairman

Attachments

City of FRESNO
Purchasing Division - (559) 621-1332 - FAX (559) 488-1069 - www.fresno.gov
2600 Fresno St, Rm 2156
Fresno CA 93721

Finance Department
Karen Bradley
Assistant Controller

DATE August 18, 2014

VIA FACSIMILE

ACE PARKING MANAGEMENT INC.
555 MONTGOMERY STREET SUITE 1150
SAN FRANCISCO CA 94111

ATTENTION: JOHN BAUMGARDNER

SUBJECT REQUEST FOR EXTENSION OF BID PROPOSAL
FOR: RFP FOR PARKING FACILITIES MANAGEMENT SERVICES
(BID FILE NO.) 9261

The City is currently evaluating the bid proposals for the above project. However, the City will not be able to make an award within the time frame allowed by the bid specifications. The City requests that your company extend your bid proposal through October 5, 2014.

Please indicate below if you are able or unable to comply with the extension request. **Return your signed response to this office no later the 5:00 PM, Monday August 25, 2014.** A fax copy is acceptable using fax number (559) 488-1069.

If you are unable to comply with the extension request, your company will no longer be eligible for award of a contract for this project and your bid deposit will be refunded.

Bid deposits will continue to be held until a contract is awarded, or all bids are rejected. Bid bonds will not be returned unless requested in writing by the Bidder.

Sincerely,

Gary Watahira
Purchasing Manager

Please check the appropriate box:

[X] Will extend bid/proposal

[ ] Will not extend bid/proposal

Signature of Authorized Individual

John Baumgardner
Name (Print)

CEO
Title

8-21-14
Date

City of
FRESNO

Purchasing Division
2600 Fresno Street, Room 2156 - Fresno - California 93721-3622
(559) 621-1332 FAX (559) 488-1069

Finance Department
Karen Bradley, Assistant Controller

NOTICE OF STAFF DETERMINATION OF CONTRACT AWARD

Posted: August 14, 2014

Staff has determined the following to be the lowest responsible bidder(s) for the project(s) listed below.

Any bidder having a specific interest in the award of a contract may file an appeal of the staff determination of contract award in accordance with Resolution 2003-129. **Note**: Resolution 2003-129 does not apply to Request for Proposals, (RFP's), Request for Qualifications (RFQ's), or Request for Information (RFI), *unless specifically included in the specifications.*

Bid File	Project	To Be Awarded
	Council Meeting September 25, 2014	
9261	Request for Proposals for Parking Facilities Management Services ($6,595,263.00)	Republic Parking

Facsimile

Date:	August 21, 2014		
To:	Gary Watahira	**From**:	John Baumgardner Ace Parking Management, Inc.
Phone:		***Phone:***	(619) 233-6624
Fax:	(559) 488-1069	***Fax:***	(619) 233-0741

Number of Pages Including Cover: 4

Comments:

ace parking management, inc. ■ 645 Ash Street ■ San Diego, CA 92101 tel 619.233.6624 fax 619.233.0741

HP Officejet Pro 8600 N911a Series

Fax Log for
Ace Parking
16192330741
Aug 21 2014 11:54AM

Last Transaction

Date	Time	Type	Station ID	Duration	Pages	Result
				Digital Fax		
Aug 21	11:52AM	Fax Sent	15594881069	1:27 N/A	4	OK

EXHIBIT 4

LETTER TO MS. DIANA REYNOLDS, BUYER II, PURCHASING DIVISION, FROM JOHN BAUMGARDNER, CEO & CHAIRMAN, ACE PARKING MANAGEMENT INC., DATED August 28, 2014.

our mission
By valuing our employees, listening to our clients, and operating under the ideals of moral integrity, quality and accountability, we will lead the parking industry in service and financial results for our clients.

Scott A. Jones
Chairman

Keith B. Jones
Managing Principal

John Baumgardner
Vice Chairman & CEO

Steve Burton
President

Founding Member of the National Parking Association

SENT VIA FACSIMILE

August 28, 2014

Ms. Diana Reynolds
Buyer II
City of Fresno Purchasing Division
2600 Fresno Street
Room 2156
Fresno, California 93721

Dear Ms. Reynolds,

On August 21, 2014, we faxed Mr. Gary Watahira our letter regarding the "RFP for Parking Facilities Management Services – Bid File No. 9261" with attachments (Exhibit A). You were kind enough to immediately respond on his behalf. Although your reply did not specifically address our questions to Mr. Watahira, we did have an additional follow-up question (Exhibit B). To date, we have not received a response.

Ace Parking Management, Inc. truly appreciates your professional consciousness throughout the RFP process. Your efforts are to be commended. However, today we checked the City of Fresno's website and it revealed that the August 14, 2014, "NOTICE OF STAFF DETERMINATION OF CONTRACT AWARD" to Republic Parking is extracted. This removal, without notice or explanation, raises serious concerns.

Therefore, since this RFP process is now convoluted, we will address all further inquiries directly to City Manager Bruce Rudd with a copy to the City of Fresno's City Council.

Communication with the City Council will be in accordance with the May 7, 2004 Ordinance No. 2004-41, "An Ordinance Of The City Of Fresno, California, Adding Article 6 To Chapter 3 Of The Fresno Municipal Code Relating to Regulated Communications With Mayor and Councilmembers During Competitive Procurement Process."

Thank you for your assistance.

Sincerely,

John Baumgardner
C.E.O. & Vice Chairman

Attachments: Exhibits A & B

cc: City Manager Bruce Rudd
Gary Watahira, Purchasing Manager

ace parking management, inc. *645 Ash Street San Diego, CA 92101* *tel 619.233.6624* *fax 619.233.0741* *www.aceparking.com*

EXHIBIT A

Our mission
By valuing our employees, listening to our clients, and operating under the ideals of moral integrity, quality and accountability, we will lead the parking industry in service and financial results for our clients.

Scott A. Jones
Chairman

Keith B. Jones
Managing Principal

John Baumgardner
Vice Chairman & CEO

Steve Burton
President

Founding Member of the National Parking Association

VIA FACSIMILE

August 21, 2014

Mr. Gary Watahira
Purchasing Manager
City of Fresno Purchasing Division
2600 Fresno Street
Room 2156
Fresno, California 93721

Dear Mr. Watahira,

Attached is Ace Parking Management, Inc.'s response to your August 18, 2014, letter regarding "Request for Extension of Bid Proposal for: RFP for Parking Facilities Management Services (BID FILE NO. 9261)."

Ace Parking Management, Inc. is enthusiastic and will remain competitive during the entire bid proposal evaluation. Therefore, our firm will extend our bid proposal through October 5, 2014. In the interest of fairness and clarity, we would also appreciate a response to our following questions:

1. Does your August 18, 2014 letter null-and-void and thus supersede the City of Fresno's website August 14, 2014 posting of: NOTICE OF STAFF DETERMNINATION OF CONTRACT AWARD" to Republic Parking with a Council meeting of September 25, 2014 (Attachment)? It would have too, correct?

2. Since the City of Fresno's August 14, 2014 posting does identify Republic Parking as the initial recommended bidder, which requires City Council approval, does this denote Republic Parking is no longer an applicant?

3. Since the Bid Proposal is extended to October 5, 2014, does this indicate that the City of Fresno will convene a separate oral board evaluation panel considering the magnitude and impact of this Bid Proposal?

Thank you for the opportunity for Ace Parking Management, Inc. to compete through October 5, 2014. We look forward to your timely written response to our questions. Please contact us at 619-233-6624 if we can be of assistance.

Sincerely,

John Baumgardner
C.E.O. & Vice Chairman

Attachments

City of
FRESNO

Finance Department
Karen Bradley, Assistant Controller

Purchasing Division
2600 Fresno Street, Room 2156 - Fresno - California 93721-3622
(559) 621-1332 FAX (559) 488-1069

NOTICE OF STAFF DETERMINATION OF CONTRACT AWARD

Posted: August 14, 2014

Staff has determined the following to be the lowest responsible bidder(s) for the project(s) listed below.

Any bidder having a specific interest in the award of a contract may file an appeal of the staff determination of contract award in accordance with Resolution 2003-129. **Note:** Resolution 2003-129 does not apply to Request for Proposals, (RFP's), Request for Qualifications (RFQ's), or Request for Information (RFI), *unless specifically included in the specifications.*

Bid File	Project	To Be Awarded
	Council Meeting September 25, 2014	
9261	Request for Proposals for Parking Facilities Management Services ($6,595,263.00)	Republic Parking

City of
FRESNO
Purchasing Division - (559) 621-1332 - FAX (559) 488-1069 - www.fresno.gov
2600 Fresno St, Rm 2156
Fresno CA 93721

Finance Department
Karen Bradley
Assistant Controller

DATE August 18, 2014

VIA FACSIMILE

ACE PARKING MANAGEMENT INC.
555 MONTGOMERY STREET SUITE 1150
SAN FRANCISCO CA 94111

ATTENTION: JOHN BAUMGARDNER

SUBJECT REQUEST FOR EXTENSION OF BID PROPOSAL
FOR: RFP FOR PARKING FACILITIES MANAGEMENT SERVICES
(BID FILE NO.) 9261

The City is currently evaluating the bid proposals for the above project. However, the City will not be able to make an award within the time frame allowed by the bid specifications. The City requests that your company extend your bid proposal through October 5, 2014.

Please indicate below if you are able or unable to comply with the extension request. **Return your signed response to this office no later the 5:00 PM, Monday August 25, 2014.** A fax copy is acceptable using fax number (559) 488-1069.

If you are unable to comply with the extension request, your company will no longer be eligible for award of a contract for this project and your bid deposit will be refunded.

Bid deposits will continue to be held until a contract is awarded, or all bids are rejected. Bid bonds will not be returned unless requested in writing by the Bidder.

Sincerely,

Gary Watahira
Purchasing Manager

Please check the appropriate box:

[✓] Will extend bid/proposal

[ ] Will not extend bid/proposal

Signature of Authorized Individual

John Baumgardner
Name (Print)

CEO 8-21-14
Title Date

Facsimile

Date:	August 21, 2014		
To:	Gary Watahira	**From:**	John Baumgardner Ace Parking Management, Inc.
Phone:		***Phone:***	(619) 233-6624
Fax:	(559) 488-1069	***Fax:***	(619) 233-0741

Number of Pages Including Cover: 4

Comments:

ace parking management, inc. ■ 645 Ash Street ■ San Diego, CA 92101 tel 619.233.6624 fax 619.233.0741

EXHIBIT B

From: John_Baumgardner@aceparking.com
Sent: Thursday, August 21, 2014 2:16 PM
To: Diana Reynolds
Subject: Re: 9261 RFP FOR PARKING FACILITIES MANAGEMENT SERVICES

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

Categories: Red Category

Diana,

Thanks for the fast response to my fax.

I still have the question - Does the August 14,2014 posting stand indicating that Republic Parking is tentatively to be awarded the contract at the September 25, 2014 Council meeting?

I look forward to your reply.

John

John Baumgardner
CEO, Vice Chairman

ace parking management, inc.
645 Ash Street
San Diego, CA 92101
tel 619.233.6624 fax 619.233.0741

Please consider the environment before printing this email

From: Diana Reynolds <Diana.Reynolds@fresno.gov>
To: "john_baumgardner@aceparking.com" <john_baumgardner@aceparking.com>,
Date: 08/21/2014 12:32 PM
Subject: 9261 RFP FOR PARKING FACILITIES MANAGEMENT SERVICES

John,

In response to your questions regarding the extension on the above. This only means that the bids have expired and that an extension is required to keep them current. You have five days prior to the award to submit

an appeal if you choose to do so.

Diana Reynolds Buyer II

City of Fresno

Purchasing

Phone 559-621-1151

FAX 559-457-1297

CONFIDENTIAL COMMUNICATION: This message is for the sole use of the intended recipients and may contain confidential material, legally privileged information, and/or information exempt from disclosure under applicable law. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you have received this e-mail in error, please so notify the sender by reply email and destroy all copies of the original.

HP Officejet Pro 8600 N911a Series

Fax Log for
Ace Parking
16192330741
Aug 28 2014 1:10PM

Last Transaction

Date	Time	Type	Station ID	Duration	Pages	Result
				Digital Fax		
Aug 28	1:07PM	Fax Sent	15594881069	2:39 N/A	10	OK

Gary Watanabe

HP Officejet Pro 8600 N911a Series

Fax Log for
Ace Parking
16192330741
Aug 28 2014 1:06PM

Last Transaction

Date	Time	Type	Station ID	Duration	Pages	Result
				Digital Fax		
Aug 28	1:03PM	Fax Sent	15594571297	3:13 N/A	10	OK

Dana Reynolds

HP Officejet Pro 8600 N911a Series

Fax Log for
Ace Parking
16192330741
Aug 28 2014 1:02PM

Last Transaction

Date	Time	Type	Station ID	Duration	Pages	Result
				Digital Fax		
Aug 28	12:58PM	Fax Sent	15596217776	3:12 N/A	10	OK

Bruce Read

EXHIBIT 5

CITY OF FRESNO, ADDENDUM NO. 5 FOR PARKING FACILITIES MANAGEMENT SERVICES BID FILE NUMBER: 9261

City of
FRESNO
Purchasing Division - (559) 621-1332 - FAX (559) 488-1069 www.ci.fresno.ca.us
2101 'G' Street, Bldg. A
Fresno, California 93706-1675

Finance Department
Karen Bradley Assistant Controller

ADDENDUM NO. 5

FOR
PARKING FACILITIES MANAGEMENT SERVICES
BID FILE NUMBER: 9261

NOTICE TO ALL BIDDERS:

This Addendum is attached to and made a part of the above entitled specifications for the City of Fresno with a scheduled bid opening date of March 18, 2014 at 3:00 P.M.

All changes and or clarifications will appear in **bold underlined type.**

The attached are clarifications to question 41, and additional locations.

CITY OF FRESNO

Gary Watahira
Interim Purchasing Manager

The bidder shall sign below indicating he/she has thoroughly read and understands the contents of this Addendum.

Signed: _____

Company: _____ Date: _____

This addendum is being distributed on online only and will not be sent by U.S. Mail. The bidder shall submit a signed copy of this addendum with their bid.

Answer to question 41

Response #41:
The Management Fee is its own line item but is included in the invoice along with all the other reimbursable expenses.

Additional locations:

PARK LISTING:

Woodward Park, 7775 N. Friant RD., Fresno CA.,
Hours of Operation: Summer, 6AM-10PM, Winter-6AM-7PM
Entry Points: 2-Fulltime, 3rd entry only used during major events

Roeding Park, 890 W. Belmont Ave, Fresno, CA., 93728
Hours of Operation: Summer, 6AM-10PM, Winter 6AM-7PM
Entry Points: 2 Full time

Sports Complex, 1707 W. Jensen Ave., Fresno Ca., 93706
Hours of Operation: Only staffed during Major events such as Soccer and Baseball Tournaments
Entry Points: 1

REQUIREMENTS:

1. Requires one supervisor.
2. Employees complete Parks and Recreation orientation/training
3. At least two (2) employees staffing the entry booths during all operating hours
4. Collect the specified City Approved entry fee
5. Provide entry tickets and receipts to all vehicles
6. Monitor parking lots and temporary parking areas for overcapacity/improper parking and resolve these situations
7. Provide general parks related information to the public
8. Coordinate with Parks and Recreation on special events at the different parks.
9. A separate Management through the addendum is established for this work.

City of FRESNO

PURCHASING DIVISION
TELEPHONE # (559) 621-1332
FAX # (559)488-1069

BID QUESTIONS FOR:
Parking Facilities Management Services
RFP No: 9261

ATTENTION: DIANA REYNOLDS| BUYER II

(FOR CITY OF FRESNO USE ONLY)
QUESTION No: 41
DATE: 3-5 REVIEWED BY:

RESPONSIBLE FOR RESPONSE:
[ ] CITY
[ ] CONSULTANT

FROM:
COMPANY: Parking Concepts Inc
CONTACT PERSON: Steve Pansini

DATE: 3/4/14
PHONE No: 925-785-0680
FAX No: 415-553-8856

QUESTION on page 21 on #4 it states payroll taxes, workers comp taxes, or taxes owed are reimbursable. Then on page 30 6.01 it asks us to include these taxes in the management fee. So we are just trying to understand which section to go by.

ANSWER:

RESPONSE BY:
INCLUDED IN ADDENDUM NO. 5 DATE: 3/6/14
DATE: 3/6/14

One question per page - Duplicate this form as necessary

RFP 07-09
08/10/11JR

Mar 05 2014 11:32AM parking concepts 213 746 3854 p.1

EXHIBIT 6

EXCERPTS FROM REPUBLIC PARKING SUBMITTED RFP PROPOSAL AS FORWARDED TO ACE PARKING MANAGEMENT INC. ON September 4, 2014, BY GARY WHATAHIRA, PURCHASING MANAGER.

	Number of Employees	Full Time (F)/ Part Time (P)	Field (F) / Office (O)	Locations
Management				
General Manager	1	F	F / O	All
Assistant Manager	1	F	F / O	All
IT/Revenue Control Manager	1	F	F / O	All
Night/Event Supervisor	1	P	F	All
Accounting Manager	1	F	O	Downtown Office
Bookkeeper/Auditor	1	F	O	Downtown Office
Office Clerk	1	P	O	Downtown Office
Maintenance				
Day Maintenance	1	F	F	All
Night Maintenance	3	F	F	All
Lead Maintenance	1	F	F	All
Cashiers				
Garage #8	1	F	F	Garage # 8
	1	P	F	Garage # 8
	1	P	F	Garage # 8
Convention Center	1	P	F	Convention Center
Ambassadors				
All City Locations	2	F	F	All
Convention Center	1	F	F	Convention Center
Events	1	P	F	All
Event Cashiers	11	P	F	Garages # 4, 7, 8, Stadium Lot & Convention Center
Traffic Directors	3	P	P	Garages # 4, 7, 8, 9, Lots # 2, Boxcar Lot & Convention Center
Total	34			

9. Does the proposer possess experience providing facilities management in a city with a similar population, downtown event venues, and facility inventory as the City of Fresno?

Yes ___X____ No _____

If "Yes", describe the location:

Of great pride to Republic Parking System is that our high rate of client retention through contract renewals and extensions has allowed us to become the largest municipal parking operator. The majority of our large Municipal urban contracts have been renewed through numerous competitive RFP processes. A complete list of all of our Urban Municipal contracts is shown in the chart below

10. Describe how you will meet the requirement to provide Parking Facilities Management Services (ref. page):

Republic Parking System submits the following Project Approach for the City of Fresno parking operation. These standards and recommendations are for the improvement of your operating income, operational efficiencies, and aesthetics of the parking facilities. Included in this section is information regarding the following:

- Staffing Plan
- Operational & Equipment Reconfiguration
- Use of Parking Technologies
- Special Event Procedures
- Local Office
- Human Resources
- Accounting/Auditing
- Maintenance Program
- Quality Assurance Plan

STAFFING PLAN

The management and staffing plan we recommend using for the City of Fresno Municipal Parking System can be summarized with two words: quality and efficiency. Republic Parking will bring in Scot Mooney who is a highly skilled parking manager with over twelve years of parking experience to lead the parking team. The remainder of the staff will be recruited from the existing staff currently working in the off-street operations and the remaining positions will be recruited in the Fresno area and potentially from other existing Republic Parking operations around the country. To attract quality people to fill the management, administrative and line positions of the operation, Republic Parking will be offering wages above the market price. Our experience has consistently proven that when we offer higher wages to our managers and line employees we attract better people and retain them, both are extremely beneficial to a parking operation.

The management team will consist of the General Manager, an Assistant Manager, an Night/Event Supervisor, an IT/Revenue Control Manager and an Accounting Manager. The following is a brief job description of each person's primary roles within the operation. Republic Parking preaches a "team approach" in all of our operations. All of our people are cross trained and educated on all aspects of the operation. This assists us in developing a sense of ownership in all of our people and creates better teamwork in our ranks.

General Manager – Scot Mooney

- Primary Client Contact
- Support City of Fresno Leadership
- Develop & Maintain Relationship with the Fresno Merchants & Business Leaders
- Develop & Implement Parking Policies & Procedures

- Supervise Entire Operation
- Quality Assurance of the Operation
- Prepare Special Client Reports (Utilization Reports, Capital Expense Plans, Budgeting, Marketing Plan, etc.)
- Review & Approve All Client Reporting
- Monitor & Implement Employee Training Programs
- Coordinate Corporate Support with Regional Vice President
- Monitor All Sub-Contractor Services & Relationships

Assistant Manager – TBD

- Assist General Manager with his Duties
- Supervise Ambassadors
- Recruiting & Hiring of Line Staff
- Supervise Maintenance & Cleaning Programs
- Coordinate Security Services with Sub-Contractor
- Perform Operational Audits of All Areas of the Operation
- Coordinate Repairs of Revenue Control Equipment
- Assist General Manager with his Duties

IT / Revenue Control Manager – TBD

- Provide system wide technical support.
- Serve as Project Manager for all IT related initiatives
- Responsible for managing all technology assets
- Responsible for PCI DSS compliancy standards and practices
- Provides a secure, well documented and audited network perimeter and interior.
- Provides detailed reporting, analysis and actionable recommendations based on the reporting/analysis.
- Provides insight and actionable recommendations regarding operational efficiencies.
- Recommendations regarding technology initiatives and upgrades to keep organization up-to-date and secure.
- Provide creative and innovative solutions to the unique challenges of the municipality which can be solved with technological innovation and application.

The Accounting and Administrative Team will support the Management Team in their duties. For improved operational and revenue controls many of the Accounting and Auditing duties will be supervised by Republic Parking's corporate accounting and auditing. Separation of duties is vital to ensure a quality revenue control program in any parking operation. The following is a brief description of duties for each Accounting and Administrative positions:

Accounting Manager – TBD

- Manage PARIS (Parking Accounts Receivable Software)
- Prepare Monthly Client Financial Reports
- Interface with Corporate Accounting Department
- Supervise Banking, Credit Card Processing
- Prepare Payroll & Payroll Reports

Bookkeeper/Auditor – TBD

- Perform Daily Audits of Revenue Reports & Bank Deposits
- Manage Accounts Payable Process
- Perform Ambassador & Event Cashier Audits
- Assist With Parking Ticket Collections

Management/Office Schedule

Position	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	Saturday	Sunday	Total Hours
General Manager	7:00a - 5:00p	7:00a - 5:00p	7:00a - 5:00p	7:00a - 5:00p	7:00a - 5:00p			40
Assistant Manager	10:00a - 8:00p	10:00a - 8:00p	10:00a - 8:00p	10:00a - 8:00p	10:00a - 8:00p			40
IT/Revenue Control Manager	6:00a - 4:00p	6:00a - 4:00p	6:00a - 4:00p	6:00a - 4:00p	6:00a - 4:00p			40
Office Manager	8:00a - 5:00p	8:00a - 5:00p	8:00a - 5:00p	8:00a - 5:00p	8:00a - 5:00p			40
Bookkeeper/Auditor	7:00a - 4:00pm	7:00a - 4:00pm	7:00a - 4:00pm	7:00a - 4:00pm	7:00a - 4:00pm			40
Office Clerk	9:00a - 3:00pm	9:00a - 3:00pm	9:00a - 3:00pm	9:00a - 3:00pm	9:00a - 3:00pm			25
Night/Event Supervisor	Based on Event Schedule							

to offer prompt personal assistance to any of the parking facilities should it be necessary for someone to travel from one facility to another.

Cashiers

There are two garages in which we would still provide cashiers, Garage #8 and the Convention Center Garage. Due to the configuration of the garage and the diversity of users at Garage #8, we would still staff the booth from 6:00am to 6:00pm. In addition, from 3:00pm to 6:00pm, our Office Clerk would be scheduled to work the second booth to ensure we can get the traffic out of the garage in a timely fashion. During our visit, we noticed the traffic build up fairly quickly at the exit around 4:00pm and your current contractor had both booths open which helped move the vehicles out of the garage fairly quickly.

At the Convention Center Garage, we have one of the three ambassadors scheduled to work primarily at this facility throughout the daytime hours. However, this person would be available to help at the other facilities since they would always be accessible with the portable tablet. In addition, we have budgeted one part-time cashier to work between the time period of 2:30pm – 6:30pm to ensure traffic move quickly during the peak time hours of the day. The extra thirty minutes after the garage closes would be to finish up their paperwork and to pick up any trash laying around the entrance and exits of the garage.

The Ambassador and Cashier schedules are as follows:

Ambassador & Cashier Schedule								
Position	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	Saturday	Sunday	Total Hours
Ambassador #1	6:30a -3:30p	6:30a -3:30p	6:30a -3:30p	6:30a -3:30p	6:30a -3:30p			40
Ambassador #2	11:30a - 6:00p	11:30a - 6:00p	11:30a - 6:00p	11:30a - 6:00p	11:30a - 6:00p			30
Ambassador #3 (Conv. Ctr.)	8:30a - 5:30p	8:30a - 5:30p	8:30a - 5:30p	8:30a - 5:30p	8:30a - 5:30p			40
Cashiers								
Garage #8	6:00a - 2:30p	6:00a - 2:30p	6:00a - 2:30p	6:00a - 2:30p	6:00a - 2:30p			40
Garage #8	2:15p - 6:15p	2:15p - 6:15p	2:15p - 6:15p	2:15p - 6:15p	2:15p - 6:15p			20
Garage #8	3:00p - 6:00p	3:00p - 6:00p	3:00p - 6:00p	3:00p - 6:00p	3:00p - 6:00p			15
Convention Center Garage	2:30p - 6:30p	2:30p - 6:30p	2:30p - 6:30p	2:30p - 6:30p	2:30p - 6:30p			20

Maintenance Staff

Our five full-time maintenance staff members will primarily be responsible for the cleaning of the parking facilities, however, they will serve many other functions. They will be trained to make repairs to the revenue control equipment, operate the power sweeper/scrubber, perform pressure washing, paint and assist the ambassadors in their duties. We typically offer a higher rate of pay for these maintenance positions to attract the most experienced and hardworking people. It is our belief that a reduced but more highly paid staff of maintenance personnel will outperform a staff that receives lower wages. Another item to note, you will notice that two of the shifts are scheduled for four days instead of the normal five day work week. We have become to realize in other parking operations that we are able

to retain maintenance personnel much longer than our competitors because individuals really enjoy having three days off each week.

One glaring flaw we typically see with our competitors maintenance plans is that all of the maintenance staff work during the days, with the last maintenance person sometimes leaving at 3:30 p.m. No attention is given to the garages in the evenings and on weekends. The best time to clean a parking garage is at night and on the weekends simply because there are very few cars in the garage to impede the maintenance work. At night no trash is hidden under vehicles; we do not have to worry about getting customer vehicles dusty from blowing out the garage; we can change light bulbs over the parking stalls; and on, and on. It is much more efficient to perform most of the maintenance work at night. The garages will be clean each morning when the first customer parks in the garage. We will staff our maintenance people at night until 3:00am to ensure the facilities are picked up after the bar crowds leave. Another reason we schedule the staff in this fashion is because it gives us another set of eyes to help with security issues.

In many of our Municipal parking operations across the country, this mentality and approach has allowed us to eliminate the security companies and has saved cities thousands of dollars and still made the facilities safer for the patrons. With this schedule we will always have a maintenance person on duty to perform any necessary cleaning. Each maintenance person will have a schedule and checklist of duties to complete each shift. We provide greater detail of our maintenance plan in a later section of this proposal.

Maintenance Schedule								
Position	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	Saturday	Sunday	Total Hours
Lead Maintenance		6:00p - 3:00a	6:00p - 3:00a	6:00p - 3:00a	6:00p - 3:00a	6:00p - 3:00a		40
Maintenance			7:00a - 4:00p	7:00a - 4:00p	7:00a - 4:00p	7:00a - 4:00p	7:00a - 4:00p	40
Maintenance	4:00p - 3:00a				4:00p - 3:00a	4:00p - 3:00a	4:00p - 3:00a	40
Maintenance		6:00p - 3:00a	6:00p - 3:00a	6:00p - 3:00a	6:00p - 3:00a	6:00p - 3:00a		40
Maintenance			4:00p - 3:00a	4:00p - 3:00a	4:00p - 3:00a	4:00p - 3:00a		40

Event Cashiers/Flaggers

For the special events that occur in downtown Fresno, Republic Parking will provide an event staff at levels commensurate with each particular event. Our Event Supervisor, with the help and support of our General Manager, will coordinate with local event venue managers to prepare a weekly event plan consisting of event cashiers and traffic directors (flaggers).

As you can see in the schedule on the next page, we are also going to have an "Event Team". You will notice we only have certain facilities on this list. Based on our equipment configuration recommendation in the next section, we do not believe it is necessary to have all of the different facilities staffed for the size of events that are occurring in Fresno. As we have done in many of our cities over the past five years, we have installed automated pay stations which allows the patrons to simply pay the machine instead of an employee. For the locations not listed, we have budgeted an ambassador whose job will be to drive to each of

these locations as traffic is building up to ensure patrons are paying the parking charge. If a patron chooses not to pay, a violation notice will be issued through our Violation and Ticketing System (VATS) that we have proposed. If a particular location is seeing a high amount of traffic, we will have the ability to pre-collect with our VATS event handhelds.

Although a few of these facilities listed below will also have automated pay stations, we believe these locations require cashiers for pre-collecting to help with the flow of traffic. In dealing with event traffic in other cities, the only problems that typically occur can be attributed from traffic backing up, patrons getting upset about the wait and then proceeding to park at a competitors facility. By having cashiers pre-collect, we believe we can increase the number of vehicles entering the garage in a much shorter period of time. In addition, by speeding up the flow of traffic and reducing the amount of traffic on the street, we can bring additional patrons into the complex who currently park in other surrounding lots due to heavy traffic on the street. It is Republic Parking System's policy not to have surrounding competing facilities with our Municipal contracts. Therefore, all of the work and effort we do will be for the City of Fresno and not private owners.

To also help with the flow of traffic into the facilities, we have included traffic directors in our budget. Although the number needed is determined by the size of the event, we only have three in the budget but realize there will be times when we may need four or five on the schedule. Each traffic director will be scheduled to work five (5) hours per night and will help with both the incoming and outgoing traffic. It will be the traffic director's responsibility to keep the traffic moving in an orderly fashion to prevent back-ups from occurring. All of the traffic directors will be carrying two-way radios so everyone is always aware of any problems that are occurring throughout the structure. Once the facilities closest to the venue are full, the traffic directors will then be sent to other locations further out to help draw in customers. During the shows, it would be the traffic director's duties to walk the entire complex and help with trash pick-up.

In working with different event venues around the country, it is our opinion that people make their decision on where to park based on the amount of time it takes to enter and exit the facility. In many cases, our survey results have shown that people feel the most important aspect in determining if they had a good parking experience was how fast they were able to exit the facility at the end of an event.

Special Event Staffing Schedule

	Cashiers	Traffic Directors
Garage #4	2	0
Garage #7	2	2
Garage #8	2	1
Stadium Lot	2	0
Convention Center	3	3

PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare: I am employed in the City and County of Fresno, California; I am over the age of eighteen years. My business address is 2125 Kern Street, Suite 101, Fresno, California 93721.

On the date indicated below, I served, in the manner indicated below, the within:

LETTER DATED SEPTEMBER 12, 2014 – RE: FORMAL PROTEST TO "NOTICE OF STAFF DETERMINATION OF CONTRACT AWARD" TO REPUBLIC PARKING SCHEDULE FOR AWARD ON SEPTEMBER 25, 2014. (RFP For Parking Facilities Management Services – No. 9261)
EXHIBITS 1 - 6

on the interested parties in said action by, placing true copies thereof, enclosed in a sealed envelope as required, and addressed as follows:

Bruce Rudd City Manager Office of City Manager 2600 Fresno Street Fresno, CA 93721-3602	Gary Watahira Purchasing Manager City of Fresno 2600 Fresno Street Fresno, CA 93721-3602

__ (*By Regular __ Express Mail*) I caused such envelopes with postage thereon fully prepaid to be placed in the U.S. mail at San Francisco, California.

X (*By Personal Delivery*) I cause such envelope(s) to be delivered by hand to the office(s) of the addressee(s). **By Ana R. Luna**

__ (*By Facsimile*) I caused a true copy thereof via facsimile to the addresses noted on the attached service at the FAX number noted after each party's address and such copies to be sent with same day service

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on September 12, 2014, at Fresno, California.

Ana R. Luna