

City of



BUDGET & MANAGEMENT STUDIES – INTERNAL AUDIT

DATE: August 22, 2011

TO: PATRICK WIEMILLER, Director, Public Works Department
DEL ESTABROOKE, Parking Manager, Public Works Department

THROUGH: RENENA SMITH, Budget Director *Renena Smith*

FROM: BOB KOURY, Principal Internal Auditor *Bob Koury*
Budget and Management Studies - Internal Audit

SUBJECT: LIMITED SCOPE AUDIT – PARKING PERMITS AND INTERNAL
CONTROLS – FINAL REPORT

Attached is the Final Audit Report of the Limited Scope Audit of Parking Permits and Internal Controls. This audit was conducted in accordance with AO 1-12 and Government Auditing Standards. An informal Audit Exit Meeting was held with the Department Parking Manager on July 18, 2011, to discuss the audit findings and proposed recommendations.

Internal Audit will perform a follow-up audit six to twelve months after this report is issued to verify that each recommendation has been implemented or that the issue documented in the finding has been resolved in a manner that addresses the weakness or risk identified. The follow-up audit is performed in accordance with AO 1-12.

Internal Audit sincerely thanks the Parking Manager and his staff for their assistance, cooperation and professionalism during the course of this limited scope audit. If you have any questions regarding this matter, please do not hesitate to contact Bob Koury, Principal Internal Auditor, at 621-7072.

Attachments

cc: Ashley Swearengin, Mayor
Council Members
Mark Scott, City Manager
Bruce Rudd, Assistant City Manager
James Sanchez, City Attorney
Joe Gray, Finance Director/City Controller
Scott Motsenbocker, Senior Budget Analyst, BMSD



Budget and Management Studies – Internal Audit

FINAL AUDIT REPORT

**Limited Scope Audit – Parking Permits and Internal
Controls**

Audit Number 11-0016 (B)

**Performed by:
Bob Koury, Principal Internal Auditor
Budget and Management Studies – Internal Audit**

Issued on August 22, 2011

Table of Contents

Introduction and Background Information	1
Audit Scope and Objectives	1
Audit Conclusion	1

Report Sections – Results and Recommendations

I. City Issued Parking Permits – “Master Database” and Overall Parking Permit Recordkeeping System and Related Documentation	2
II. Official Vehicle Permits (OVP’s)	3
III. Car Pool Permits	5
IV. Residential Parking Permits	6
V. Visitor Temporary Permits	8
VI. Downtown Parking Contracts and Miscellaneous Permits	8

Introduction and Background Information

The City has established policies and procedures concerning employee parking in the downtown area. Administrative Orders 7-1, 7-2, 7-3 and 7-4 (copies attached) address the various parking policies and different type parking permits issued by the Parking Division of the Public Works Department.

Zone “A” – City Hall Complex – work site: City Hall, includes the Promenade Lot on the south side of Tulare Street between the railroad tracks and “R” Street, and also the City Hall parking lot at the corner of Tulare and “P” Streets which is only for Official Vehicle Permit and Car Pool Permit employees.

Zone “B” – Water Tower Complex – work sites: FPD Headquarters, City Hall Annex, Veteran’s Building, which includes Lots A, C, N, T and Convention Center Garage.

All City employees must have his/her permanent work site in one of the two above established work site “Zones” and all employees must request the appropriate parking permit in writing by completing the “Employee Parking Permit Request Form” provided by the Parking Division of the Public Works Department.

For FY11, the total actual Permit Parking revenues for all parking permit types, including non-City employees working in the downtown area and contract parking fees, was approximately \$1,100,000.

Audit Scope and Objectives

This audit was performed by the Principal Internal Auditor during June and July 2011. The primary objectives of this limited scope audit were: 1) to determine if all City issued parking permits have been issued in accordance with established City policies and procedures and that fees per the City’s approved Master Fee Schedule (MFS) were properly assessed and collected, 2) to test and determine the adequacy and accuracy of all documentation in support of all parking permits covered in this audit, and; 3) to identify any weaknesses in the parking permit processes, procedures and internal controls and to then propose appropriate audit recommendations to City Management to strengthen and improve such internal controls and related recordkeeping for all City issued parking permits.

The various downtown parking contracts were also reviewed in conjunction with this audit but on a very limited basis. (See Section VI and Exhibit A in this report.)

Audit Conclusion

Overall, the Parking Division Manager and his limited staff should be commended for their efforts and professionalism in the issuance, recordkeeping and oversight of City issued parking permits. There are some areas, however, that were noted during the course of this audit that need to be addressed by the Department and Parking Division Management for improved internal controls and recordkeeping related to City issued parking permits. These areas are addressed throughout this audit report.

Report Sections – Results and Recommendations

I. City Issued Parking Permits – “Master Database” and Overall Parking Permit Recordkeeping System and Related Documentation

- A. Upon request of the Parking Division for their current “Master Database Parking Permit Listing” for all City employees as of June 9, 2011, Internal Audit was provided a lengthy schedule of approximately 1,400 line items (employees). However, during the course of the audit and related testing and verification from the “Master Database Parking Permit Listing” to the actual Parking Permit Applications/Forms on file in the Parking Division, there were only 640 active City employees with current parking permits. The Master Parking Permit Listing has not been updated on an ongoing basis, as it included over 700 employees who had either left City service or no longer was in need of a City parking permit for whatever reason.
- B. The “Master Database Parking Permit Listing” is organized alphabetically by employee name which is good; however, the different type Parking Permits /City Parking Lot records/files located in the Parking Division are maintained by Permit #. This difference in the manner in which these records are maintained creates inefficiencies when wanting to quickly and easily research, verify or make any type disposition of an employee’s parking permit. This is especially true for the larger Lots/Employee Permit files, e.g. Promenade and “T” Lots.
- C. Other miscellaneous audit findings per review of actual Parking Permit Applications/Forms on file in Parking Division for all employees with parking permits as follows:
- ▶ Many employees changed parking lots during City employment; however, Parking Permit Applications/Forms for the current Lot was not filed in the correct Lot Folder in the Parking Division;
 - ▶ “Parking Rules and Guidelines” (reverse side of Permit Form) not signed by some employees as acknowledgement of such City rules and guidelines as a parking permit holder; and
 - ▶ Parking Supervisor’s approval/signature not on many Parking Permit Applications/Forms on file in the Parking Division.

Audit Recommendations

1. The Parking Division staff should review the “Master Database Parking Permit Listing” and compare to all current and active City employees who possess a City issued parking permit at the time of their review. Based on that review, the “Master Permit Listing” should be updated so that it only contains current and active parking permit holders in the City for improved efficiency and ease of research and reference purposes.

Management Response to Recommendation 1

Parking Services will initiate a review of the data base and verify through Personnel its currency. Parking Services will also be evaluating the data base and how it can be improved. We estimate that within 90 days of this report a new data base can be developed. Estimated Completion Date: September 30, 2011.

2. In conjunction with the implementation of recommendation 1 above, all Parking Permit "Lots/Garages" files which contain actual Parking Permit Applications should be organized in an alphabetical format to coincide with the "Master Database Parking Permit Listing" for ease of research and parking permit transactions by employee versus parking permit numbers.

Management Response to Recommendation 2

All employee files containing the Parking Permit applications will be organized in alphabetical order coinciding with the data base. Estimated Completion Date: September 30, 2011.

3. The Parking Division Supervisor and staff should ensure that all City employees have signed the Parking Permit Application Forms as acknowledgement of City policies and procedures related to parking permits. The Parking Division Supervisor should also ensure that he (or other designee) has signed and approved all Parking Permit Applications for documentation and audit trail purposes.

Management Response to Recommendation 3

Our counter staff is re-trained to ensure that prior to an employee leaving the parking counter they will inspect the application. Those Applications returned via mail will be sent back to the applicant if not properly signed.

II. Official Vehicle Permits (OVP's)

Official Vehicle Permits (OVP's) may be issued to employees when assignment of a City vehicle is not feasible, they meet the established criteria, and only for conducting City business (copy of AO 7-3 attached for reference purposes).

As of June 12, 2011, there were a total of 159 OVP Parking Permits issued to City employees who were paying the \$20 per month permit fee, in accordance with the City's Master Fee Schedule. However, during the audit of OVP's and related parking permit files and payroll deductions for such parking permits, the following audit exceptions were noted:

- ▶ AO 7-3 specifically states that OVP's are for City of Fresno employees only; however, it was noted that several Non-City staff/outside agencies have been provided OVP's by the Parking Division and with no cost to the individuals/agencies, i.e. County Board of Supervisor members, County Administrative Officer, District Attorney, Council of Fresno County Governments, City of

Clovis and ACE Parking, Inc. employees. There was also no written authorization/approval from the City Manager's Office for these OVP's to be issued to these individuals/outside agencies.

AO 7-4, Visitor Temporary Permits, allows for these "temporary" permits to be issued to outside contractors, commission/committee members or other governmental agencies who conduct business at City Hall. The fees associated with these Visitor Temporary Permits can also be waived by the City Manager or his designee, as considered appropriate.

Audit Recommendation

4. The Parking Division Manager and/or Department Director should either obtain written authorization/approval from the City Manager's Office for the issuance of these specific OVP's and maintain this documentation on file in the Parking Division for reference purposes and amend AO 7-3 accordingly, or utilize AO 7-4 Visitor Temporary Permits for these non-City staff and governmental agencies who conduct business at City Hall.

Management Response to Recommendation 4

Parking has drafted changes to AO 7-4 Visitor Temporary Permits that will now include the aforementioned. A Visitors Permit that meets the required criteria with approvals will be issued in lieu of the OVP. Changes to 7-3 Official Vehicle Permits will also be changed to simplify the process on approval designees. Both AO changes are being drafted but it will take approximately 6 months to get them updated. Estimated Completion Date: November 2011.

- ▶ AO 7-3 specifically states that the City Manager will authorize (approve) OVP's for City Council Members, their Assistants, and all Department Directors. However, it was noted during the audit that none of these individuals who currently have a City OVP were formally authorized to obtain such parking permits by the City Manager.

Audit Recommendation

5. The OVP's for City Council Members, their Assistants, and all Department Directors should be formally approved by the City Manager, as required by AO 7-3, or, by the City Manager's authorized designee, e.g. Assistant City Manager, DPW Director or City's Parking Division Manager for improved internal controls over these parking permits.

Management Response to Recommendation 5

AO 7-3 Official Vehicle Permit Program is being amended that will streamline the approval process. Added will be a CMO Designee and the Parking Manager.

- ▶ An employee who started employment with the City of Fresno in March 2003 was issued an OVP and was still in possession of, and using, this parking permit as of the audit date; however, it was determined through this audit and related payroll deduction documentation that the employee was only paying \$15 a month versus the \$20 per month fee per the Master Fee Schedule for this special parking permit. As a result, the employee has underpaid the City approximately \$500 for the OVP as of June 2011.

Note: Internal Audit informed the Parking Division Supervisor of this audit finding at the time of discovery and it was immediately corrected for the proper OVP fee going forward, and the applicable employee was also informed by the Parking Supervisor of the change to his payroll deduction.

Audit Recommendation

6. The Parking Services Division Supervisor or other staff should obtain the current parking permit payroll deduction report from the Finance Department's Payroll Division at least once or twice a year and compare the report to all active parking permit holders to ensure the proper parking permit fee per the MFS is being deducted accordingly.

Management Response to Recommendation 6

The AO is being updated to require this reporting. Estimated Completion Date: November 2011.

- ▶ As the AO 7-3 related to the City's Official Vehicle Permit Program is almost 8 years old, it may be appropriate for the Department and Parking Division Manager to review and revise this particular AO for any additional needed procedures, documentation and internal controls related to these special parking permits for City employees, e.g. as noted above.

Audit Recommendation

7. The Parking Division Manager should review and revise/update AO 7-3 as considered appropriate for improved procedures, efficiencies and internal controls related to OVP's.

Management Response to Recommendation 7

The AO is being updated with an estimated completion date of November 2011.

III. Car Pool Permits

Per AO 7-1, carpool applicants must be permanent City employees assigned to the Zone "A" or Zone "B" work areas. Car pooling exists when one vehicle is used "to transport more than one employee to his/her work location in the downtown area, a minimum of three times a week".

As of the audit date, there were 15 active car pool permits issued by the Parking Division and in use by various City employees. Internal Audit performed various audit procedures, including the comparison of Car Pool Permit Applications information on file in the Parking Division to email “confirmations” from all car pool employees. The internal auditor also performed actual observations of all vehicles parking in the car pool stalls on three consecutive days and documented his findings. Various exceptions were noted as a result of the audit of car pool permit holders, as follows:

- ▶ Vehicle license #'s of three vehicles observed parking in car pool stalls did not agree to the license #'s on the Car Pool Permit Applications on file in the Parking Division; and one car pool employee (rider) did not provide their vehicle license # to the Parking Division at the time the application was submitted;
- ▶ Two car poolers (drivers) for two different car pool stalls did not have active riders at the time of the audit (one had left the City two months ago and one had recently retired from the City, with neither drivers replacing their riders, as required by AO 7-1. Note: As a result of this audit and communication of such findings to the employees and to the Parking Division Supervisor, both car pool permits were turned into the Parking Division.

Audit Recommendation

8. The Parking Division Supervisor or his designee should perform random, e.g. every 6 months, observations of City Car Poolers and note their respective vehicle license numbers and the number of riders to ensure compliance with AO 7-1 and for improved internal controls and accountability over these parking stalls.

Management Response to Recommendation 8

Every 6 months the Parking Manager or his designee will perform a physical check of the carpooler roster to include proper usage, and appropriate vehicle information, and include type and license plate.

IV. Residential Parking Permits

Per the Parking Services Division “Standard Operating Procedures” dated 10/13/08 (copy attached for reference purposes), “*any citizen living within a residential parking district may be issued a total of 5 parking permits; one for their home, and one for each vehicle registered (maximum 4) to their address*”. These permits are valid for 12 months from October 1 to September 30. Per the same Parking Services Procedures, the first permit is free and each additional permit (maximum 4) is \$19 each.

As a result of our audit procedures performed and tests of supporting documentation related to the issuance of residential parking permits by the Parking Services Division, the following audit findings were noted:

- ▶ The Parking Services Division issues residential parking permits based on the submission and verification of the required documentation per established

Division Procedures for Parking Districts 1, 2, 5, 6, 7, 9 & Garland. Fees are assessed and collected by the Parking Division in accordance with their Division Procedures and the City's Master Fee Schedule. However, the "residential parking permit database" that documents the issuance of such parking permits does not include the date the permit was issued or the Cashier Memo Number. Without this critical information, it is very difficult and time consuming to locate the actual transactions for the issuance and sale of residential parking permits, i.e. very weak audit trail, both for the Parking Division staff as well as for audit purposes.

Audit Recommendation

9. The Parking Services Division staff should immediately commence entering the date a residential parking permit is issued and the related Cashier Memo number into the residential parking permit "database" for improved internal controls and adequate audit trail.

Management Response to Recommendation 9

Parking Service ensures that dates will be affixed to the permit, the cashier memo, and the data base, ensuring that all three reflect the same date. Parking will coordinate with the individual Council District and determine why there is not a fee being charged.

- ▶ Per the Parking Services Division, City Council staff do issue, on occasion, residential parking permits to individuals within Parking Districts 3 & 4 separate from the Parking Division; however, no fees are assessed for these parking permits by the City Council staff.
- ▶ The City's Master Fee Schedule for "Residential Permits" (copy attached for reference purposes) only stipulates that the first residential permit is "no charge" and additional vehicles are \$19 per year, i.e. the MFS does not address any specific Parking Districts by number within the City as either "no charge" or "charge", nor does it include any "maximums" for vehicles after the first vehicle versus the Parking Division Procedures that stipulates "maximum 4".

Audit Recommendation

10. The Department Director and/or Parking Services Division Manager should ensure that the MFS section related to residential parking permits (page 172) is being complied with on a consistent and citywide basis, i.e. by both the Parking Services Division and City Council staff. If it is determined that different policies and permit fee assessment practices will continue between the Parking Division and City Council staff, this should be documented and approved by the City Manager's Office, and the MFS and Departmental procedures should be revised accordingly.

Management Response to Recommendation 10

Parking Services has surveyed both districts and has recommended to the District #5

Council Member that both residential parking districts be removed. The two major entities that caused both districts creation have been eliminated. Council Action will be required to eliminate both. Estimated Completion Date: January 2012.

V. **Visitor Temporary Permits**

AO 7-4 addresses the City's policies and procedures for the issuance and fee assessments related to temporary parking permits for visitors (or City staff) from outside the downtown area and in conjunction with City related functions or business at City Hall.

Per discussions with Parking Division Management during the course of this audit, it was indicated that the use and implementation of this particular AO by the Parking Services Division or by other City Departments related to visitors to City Hall was not occurring or, if it was utilized, it was very limited citywide. Based on this information, no detailed audit procedures were performed related to these type parking permits.

As this AO is almost 8 years old, it appears appropriate for the Department and Parking Division Manager to review and revise this particular AO for any additional needed procedures, documentation and internal controls related to these type parking permits for visitors to City Hall, and for its continued existence within the City's organization.

Audit Recommendation

11. The Parking Division Manager should review and revise/update AO 7-4 as considered appropriate for improved procedures, efficiencies and internal controls related to Visitor Temporary Parking Permits.

Management Response to Recommendation 11

Concur. The AO is being updated. The Personnel Division has provided the templates and we are in the process of making changes. Estimated Completion Date: February 2012.

VI. **Downtown Parking Contracts and Miscellaneous Permits**

In conjunction with this Parking Permit audit, two additional areas were reviewed but no significant audit procedures were performed due to the nature of these two areas and time constraints, as follows:

A. **Downtown Parking Contracts**

- ▶ As of the date of this audit report and based on information provided to Internal Audit by both the City's Parking Manager and ACE Parking Manager, there are eight (8) separate parking contracts between the City of Fresno and various entities (primarily governmental) for downtown parking. Based on this information and Internal Audit's review of each Parking Contract and related parking rates, **Exhibit A** attached to this audit report was prepared by Internal Audit.

This schedule is primarily being provided as informational purposes for City Management’s review and to document the various parking permit rates for these entities as compared to the City’s recently approved (Effective 7-1-11) Parking Permit rates for both monthly uncovered (\$75) and covered (\$90) for all other individuals who park at City lots and garages downtown. As reflected on Exhibit A, the parking rates for these various contractors vary significantly and are also well below the parking permit rates of \$75 for uncovered and \$90 for covered parking for “non-contracting” individuals.

Audit Recommendation

12. The Department Director and/or Parking Division Manager should continue their ongoing efforts in the renegotiation of these various downtown parking contracts for the City to ensure the assessment of reasonable and appropriate parking permit rates/fees for these parking lots and garages, and to help defray the ongoing maintenance expenses of such City lots and garages.

Management Response to Recommendation 12

Efforts will continue to update and eliminate these contracts that put a strain on the revenue required to mitigate Parking Services Debt.

- ▶ It was also noted that the current MFS (page 169) contains a section entitled “Special Rates Established by Agreement”. This section of the MFS contains only two of the eight downtown parking contracts included in Exhibit A to this report. In addition, the MFS rates for these two contractors do not agree with the current rates as per Exhibit A.

Audit Recommendation

13. The Parking Division Manager should omit the current “Special Rates Established by Agreement” section in the MFS (page 169) since the parking terms, conditions and established parking permit rates are established outside the MFS process via the City and outside entities parking contracts approved by City Management and City Council.

Management Response to Recommendation 13

The Special Rates section will be eliminated from the MFS via action. It will be included in a MFS update that should be scheduled for the end of August 2011.

B. Miscellaneous Downtown Permits

The current MFS (page 172), under “Parking, Downtown”, contains the following:

Permit parking (“G”, “E”, and “F” Street Lots)

See rates under Parking Permits

<i>Monthly per vehicle</i>	
<i>Annually per vehicle</i>	\$83


Upon inquiry by the internal auditor of the Parking Manager regarding these particular permits and rate, he indicated as to the best of his knowledge, this section of the MFS has existed for several years but had not been used for many years by the Parking Division. The Parking Division records also did not reflect any transactions related to these type permits during the audit.

Audit Recommendation

14. The Parking Division Manager should determine the need for these type parking permits in the City and the related section in the MFS and take the appropriate action to address this audit finding.

Management Response to Recommendation 14

The rates are being eliminated from the MFS as part of an MFS update scheduled for August 2011.

Subject: Parking Policy – Eligibility for Employee Parking Permits	Number: 7-1
	Date Issued: December 1, 1998 Date Revised: June 9, 2010
Responsible Department: Public Works	Approved: 

Purpose

To establish a uniform policy and procedure concerning employee parking by City employees in the downtown area bounded by the two complex areas identified below. From time-to-time, various changes in parking locations in the downtown area may occur due to construction or loss of a parking lot. Employees may be moved to other parking locations as close as practical to their work location during these times. Employees will be contacted before the actual move date and briefed on parking options.

Policy

To obtain an Employee Parking Permit:

1. An employee must have his/her permanent work site in the established downtown area.
2. An employee must request a parking permit in writing by completing the Employee Parking Permit Request Form provided by the Parking Section of the Public Works Department.
3. An employee may only obtain a permit for the parking lot zone within the employee's work site. Zone "A" is the City Hall Complex area and Zone "B" is the Water Tower Complex area.
4. At the time the request is made, if stalls are not immediately available in parking lots within the employee's work site, the employee's name will be placed on a waiting list, which determines the priority for the next available parking stall. A waiting list will be established for each employee lot in close proximity to the employee's workplace in either the City Hall Complex area, referred to as Zone "A", or the Water Tower Complex area, referred to as Zone "B". An employee can be offered a parking permit in the Stadium Lot or Boxcar Lot provided with shuttle service. The Stadium Lot is located at Kern and "H" Streets, and the Boxcar Lot is located at Fresno and "H" Streets.

Procedures

Zone A City Hall Complex - Work Site: City Hall

Promenade Lot: south side of Tulare between railroad tracks and "R" Street

Zone B Water Tower Complex - Work Sites: FPD Headquarters, City Hall Annex, Veteran's Building.

"A" Lot - south side of Merced between "N" and "O" Streets, behind the Veteran's Bldg.

"C" Lot - west of the metered Federal Lot, at "O" Street, between Fresno and Mariposa Streets.

"N" Lot - east side of "N" Street, between Fresno and Mariposa.

"T" Lot - north side of Tulare, between "N" and "O" Streets.

Convention Center Garage - corner of Inyo and "O" Streets

2. **Waiting List**

The Parking Section of Public Works will maintain a waiting list for each Zone area. It shall be established on a first-come, first-served basis and by the date the employee signed the Employee Parking Permit Request or Wait List form. When an employee parking permit becomes available in a parking lot in a Zone area, it will be offered to the person heading the waiting list for that Zone. If the employee declines the permit, he/she will have one additional opportunity to accept a permit. If the employee turns down the permit a second time, his/her name shall be placed at the bottom of the waiting list. At the time of each denial, a Parking Permit Denial Form must be completed by the employee to establish a record of the declined permit offer.

3. **Permits**

At the time of issuance, a qualified employee will receive one (1) hang tag parking permit, a City of Fresno parking permit map, and a Rules bulletin. The employee must read and sign the Rules bulletin acknowledging receipt of this information. The hang tag permit is to be displayed in accordance with this administrative policy. The permit will be numbered and identified by lot or car pool stall.

No additional permits will be issued for secondary vehicles. The hang tag is designed for quick removal and placement in another vehicle. In the event a temporary replacement is required, one-day permits are available and may be issued for up to a maximum of one week.

If the permit is lost or stolen, an employee may purchase a replacement permit. The stolen or missing permit number will be removed from the hang tag parking permit inventory. The lot designation and hang tag number will be forwarded to parking control who will periodically inspect the parking locations and attempt to locate the missing hang tag permit.

4. **Permits for Designated Stalls**

If an employee has been assigned a designated parking stall for his/her use only, a special permit will be issued that is maintained by the responsible department. The employee must pay a monthly rental fee.

5. Display of Parking Permit

The hang tag permit is valid only in the assigned lot or stall assigned. It is required that the hang tag permit be properly displayed when the employee's vehicle is parked in the assigned lot or stall, and it is the employee's responsibility to ensure that the hang tag permit is properly displayed. A properly displayed permit is as follows:

- Hang tag permits must be displayed within the vehicle on the front rearview mirror and must be visible, or on the front dash within the vehicle, on the driver's side.
- Temporary permits must be displayed on the front dash within the vehicle, on the driver's side.

6. Car Pool Permits

Permits for a designated car pool stall will be assigned on a first-come, first-served basis and based upon availability. All carpool applicants must be permanent City employees assigned to the Zone A or Zone B work areas. Priority will be given to applications where 2 or more employees are assigned to City Hall. In the event a car pool stall is not available, a car pool waiting list will be maintained.

Car pooling exists when one vehicle is used to transport more than one employee to his/her work location in the downtown area, a minimum of three times a week.

A car pooling arrangement may be established by completion of a Car Pool Application Form, signed by all car pool participants. The application must be submitted and approved by the Parking Manager. One designated parking stall will be assigned for the vehicles in the approved car pool and one hang tag parking permit will be issued for all participants.

City employees issued Official Vehicle Parking permits or assigned to City vehicles, or those having been issued a permit for another City lot, may not be considered part of the car pooling arrangement or assigned a car pool permit.

7. Fees and Charges

City employees will pay a monthly rental fee when granted an employee parking permit or a designated parking stall. It is required that the method of payment shall be through City payroll deduction from the employee's regular paycheck. Persons under contract with the City who are not paid through the City's payroll system must pay the monthly fee directly to the Parking Section of Public Works at the beginning of each month's use. All parking permit fees will be established by the City Council, provided, however, that the effective date of any new monthly fee shall be the first of the month following Council action.

8. Failure to Display Parking Permit

Vehicles without valid, properly displayed parking permits are subject to citation under Section 14-1014 of the Fresno Municipal Code, or to payment of a penalty fee in the amount established in the Master Fee Schedule. For citations issued, each employee shall be allotted one void every 12 months under administrative action when cited for failing to display parking permits. Any violation of this section over the one void allocation will result in fine and/or loss of parking permit privileges.

9. Non-transferability

Parking permits are non-transferable, may not be traded or sub-leased, and are for the employee's use only.

10. Relinquishment of Employee Parking Permit

A parking permit hang tag is City property and employees are required to turn in the hang tag permit upon separation from City employment, change in qualifying work location, or when an employee becomes ineligible according to this administrative policy. The hang tag permit must be turned in to the Parking Section of the Public Works Department, and the employee must complete the appropriate form to discontinue payroll deduction for parking fees.

11. Non-eligibility

City employees assigned a City vehicle on a permanent or overnight basis are not eligible for employee parking permits but may park their vehicles in the Promenade Lot in the areas designated for official vehicles by posted signage. City employees who are authorized to use their own vehicles on City business and are provided with an Official Vehicle Parking permit are not eligible for employee parking permits. City employees having work areas outside of the downtown area are not eligible.

12. Loss of Parking Privilege

Any employee not abiding by these procedures or any parking regulations established by the City Manager may, upon the recommendation of the Public Works Director and Parking Manager, and with approval of the City Manager, lose all employee parking privileges.

13. Relocation of Permittee

The Public Works Director and/or the Parking Manager, or his/her designee, reserves the right to relocate permittees from one lot to another lot, but will do so only with due cause and will attempt to do so on the basis of seniority in a lot, or seniority on the waiting list.

14. Relocation of Permittees Due to Loss of Parking Facility

The Public Works Director and/or the Parking Manager, or his/her designee, will attempt to relocate permittees from a lot that is being taken out of service, into a lot as close as possible to the permittee's assigned work location. Care shall be taken to ensure that seniority of the person in the parking program is maintained and utilized in the decision making when establishing the new location of placement of the permittee.

Subject: Parking Policy-City Parking Facilities	Number: 7-2
	Date Issued: October 30, 2003 Date Revised: September 15, 2009
Responsible Department: Public Works	Approved: <i>AT [Signature]</i>

Purpose

To establish a uniform policy regarding City employees parking in City-owned, privately operated parking garages and lots, the Convention Center lot, and on the street.

Policy

No vehicle operated by a City employee is exempt from restrictions imposed by a passenger loading zone, commercial loading zone, alley loading zone, handicap zone, or other restrictive curb controls, except City vehicles marked police, fire, or emergency type vehicles. City parking enforcement vehicles may park in these zones for short periods while enforcing in the immediate vicinity.

All City employees are subject to the standard parking fees when parking at meters or utilizing the City-owned, privately operated off-street parking facilities in the downtown area and the Convention Center facilities, except as follows:

Procedures

1. Vehicles displaying applicable parking permits issued by the Parking Division of the Public Works Department are exempt from paying for parking at meters on the street or in off-street parking lots when being used for City business as indicated by the permit. They can be parked indefinitely in the off-street garages and lots when being used for City business and away from their normal parking area.
2. "E" Plated City of Fresno Vehicles can park in the designated city vehicle one hour parking zone located on Q Street behind City Hall. If no stall is available in this area, city vehicles can park at the parking meters along Q Street for a period not to exceed 30 minutes. City vehicles parked in this area will have the tires chalked and if they exceed the 30 minute restriction, citations can be issued. Free parking for City vehicles is located in the Promenade Parking Lot.

Subject: Official Vehicle Permit Program	Number: 7-3
	Date Issued/Revised: October 30, 2003
Responsible Department: Public Works	Approved:

To establish a uniform policy and procedure, and the method to be used to issue Official Vehicle Permit (OVP) parking permits to City of Fresno employees, while conducting City business.

Official Vehicle Permits may be issued to employees when assignment of a City vehicle is not feasible, they meet the established criteria, and only for conducting City business.

Criteria for Determining Eligibility for Official Vehicle Permits

1. The Mayor and three (3) Staff Assistants.
2. All members of the City Council and one (1) Council Assistant per district.
3. All Department Directors.
4. City of Fresno Redevelopment Director and Administrator.
5. City employees using personal vehicles for official business and compensated pursuant to Administrative Order 2-2, Categories 1, 2 and 3 (excluding 4). The following summarizes the categories under this Administrative Order:

Category 1: The City Manager receives a transportation allowance under Category 1 of the Private Vehicle Rental Program.

Category 2: Assistant City Managers, Department Directors, Assistant Department Directors, Division Managers, Section Supervisors responsible for 24-hour service functions, primary staff representatives to governmental bodies or community organizations requiring numerous off-hour meetings, and individuals responsible for work sites involving excessive mileage, frequent evening, weekend and early morning inspection travel.

Category 3: Employees whose work assignments include full-time duties requiring them to frequently travel between crews or work sites, but not requiring frequent off-hours travel, and who may be directed to use their personal vehicles in the conduct of City business.

Those employees meeting the criteria of Category 4 can be authorized an OVP only with the written approval of the City Manager. The following information summarizes Category 4:

Category 4: Employees who occasionally travel to conduct official City business, not having access to division vehicles or pool vehicles, can be directed to use their private vehicles and be reimbursed. If mileage exceeds 600 miles per month for City business, reassignment to Category 2, should be considered.

Employees qualifying for Official Vehicle Permits pursuant to the criteria in this Administrative Order will complete the Official Vehicle Permit application.

The City Manager's Office will authorize Official Vehicle Permits for members of the City Council, Council Assistants, Department Directors, and others deemed necessary.

Employees qualifying and approved for an Official Vehicle Permit will pay a monthly rental fee, as fixed by the Master Fee Schedule. The method of payment will be a payroll deduction from the employee's regular paycheck; a Payroll Deduction form and Official Vehicle Permit application must be completed in order for the Public Works Parking Manager to issue or reissue a valid permit. Employees from outside the downtown area who visit downtown offices may be provided a Visitor's permit in lieu of the Official Vehicle Permit.

Official Vehicle Permits are considered City property and, if an employee separates from City employment, it is required that the permit be turned in to the Parking Section of Public Works prior to or on the employee's final work day.

If an employee's eligibility changes, the Official Vehicle Permit must be turned in to the Parking Section of Public Works and the employee must complete the payroll form to cancel the parking fee deduction.

Vehicles without valid, properly displayed permits are subject to citation under Section 10-1014 of the Fresno Municipal Code, or payment of a penalty fee in the amount established in the Master Fee Schedule.

In the event a parking stall is not available in a City lot, a permit holder may park in a metered space. At no time shall Official Vehicle Permit holders be authorized to park in Media or Car Pool parking stalls.

Subject: Parking Policy—Visitor Temporary Permits	Number: 7-4
	Date Issued/Revised: October 30, 2003
Responsible Department: Public Works	Approved:

Purpose

To establish a uniform policy and procedure for parking visitors, volunteers, contractors, consultants, commission/committee members, and City staff from outside the downtown area, for visiting City offices while in conjunction with a City function or event, or the conducting of City business in the downtown parking area bounded by Tuolumne, Freeway 99, and Freeway 41 on the south and east sides of downtown.

Procedures

To obtain a temporary visitor parking permit, the requesting City department must complete and submit a Visitor Parking Permit Application for approval by the Parking Manager.

Fees and Charges

Annual and daily visitor permits may be issued after application approval by the Parking Manager, based on the following criteria:

1. Outside consultants who work more than 60 total days of the year at City Hall.
 - a. Cost: \$180 per year, per permit, or \$15 per month.
2. City department staff from outside the downtown area who use private vehicles for City business at City Hall (limit 5 permits per department).
 - a. Cost: \$50 per year, per permit.
3. Other governmental agencies conducting business at City Hall. The City Manager or his designee can waive this fee.
 - a. Cost: \$50 per year, per permit.
4. Other users approved by the Parking Manager based on review of the request and need.
 - a. Cost: \$2 per day, per permit.

The requesting City department will be billed through interdepartmental charges based on the above.

STANDARD OPERATING PROCEDURES

Residential Parking Permits

Date: October 13, 2008

Purpose

To establish a written policy in accordance with FMC 14-2001 thru 14-2016, for issuing residential parking permits to residents living within a Residential Parking Districts. **Any citizen living within a residential parking district may be issued a total of 5 parking permits; one for their home, and one for each vehicle registered (maximum 4) to their address.**

Policy

It is not the intent of the City of Fresno, or this office to cause a hardship for individuals living within a Residential Parking District to receive a parking permit. Our purpose and goal is to ensure permits are issued to the proper citizens, and in a consistent manner. To accomplish this, residents will be required to provide the documents as stated in the following procedures before they will be issued a residential parking permit.

Procedures

Residential parking permits are valid for 12 months from October 1 to September 30. Since permits renew annually Parking Services has made it our policy to give a 15 day grace period **(except for residential parking district #1)** for residents to renew their permits without receiving a parking citation.

The following guidelines will be adhered to when issuing residential parking permits:

- 1) One free permit: **(office staff shall check the data base to verify that a free permit was not issued previously).**
 - a) Valid ID
 - b) Billing statement (PG&E, phone, utilities)
 - c) Lease or mortgage agreements

- 2) Additional permits:
 - a) Vehicle registration for each vehicle registered to the address **(maximum 4)**
 - b) Valid ID

- c) If the vehicle is registered to the address, but registered to another family member, that person will need to be present before a permit will be issued

Fees and Charges;

- a) First permit is free
- b) Each additional permit \$19 (**maximum 4**)

Payment method:

- a) Check (ensure to write the cashier memo number on the check)
 - b) Money orders (ensure to write the cashier memo number on the money order)
 - c) Credit/debit card (ensure to write the cashier memo number on the receipt)
 - d) Cash
- 1) Required information on the Cashier memo's (examples are located in the Cashier Memo reference book).
 - a) Name and address of resident
 - b) Serial number of issued permits
 - c) Method of payment
 - d) Clerk signature

Exceptions:

- 1) Block captains – Nancy Towery and Joan Selland - have been authorized by management to purchase (with proper documentation) residential parking permits for the residents on their blocks.
- 2) Any landlord or property owner that states they have been authorized to pick up permits for their property must have that permission renewed annually.

**CITY OF FRESNO
MASTER FEE SCHEDULE**

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT

PARKING FEES

<u>Fee Description & Unit/Time</u>	<u>Current</u>	<u>Amnd</u>
Parking, City of Fresno Employees		
All lots / per month	15.00	
Replacement permit / per replacement	10.00	
Official vehicle permit / per month	20.00	
Parking, DMV Hold Administrative Fee		
Per violation	5.00	
Parking Late Payment Penalties		
Overtime Parking Penalty / per violation	2 times penalty	
Restricted Zone Penalty / per violation	2 times penalty	
Parking Permits*		489
Mall Specific and Non-Mall Specific Areas, Permits Parking Rates in Garages and Lots		
Permit Hours based on Option Selected and Fees Paid.		
All Permits will be assigned a specific Garage or Lot, dependent on location selected and Plan.		
6 am to 6pm, Mon-Fri		
Uncovered spaces per month	75.00	500
Covered spaces per month	90.00	500
Annual Purchase		
Each option listed above can be reduced by purchasing these permits at the annual rate, with annual prepayment required. Purchase is equal to payment for 10 months parking, with 12 month received.		

**CITY OF FRESNO
MASTER FEE SCHEDULE**

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT

PARKING FEES

<u>Fee Description & Unit/Time</u>	<u>Current</u>	<u>Amnd</u>
Special Rates Established by Agreement		
1 Fresno County Schools Admin Agreement - effective February 2, 1993		
Garage 8 only		
Per month	26.00	
Per quarter	74.24	
Per year	260.00	
2 Housing Authorities of City and County Agreement - effective May 28, 1993		
Garage 9U only		
Per annum	235.93	
Parking Meter Hood Rental		
Deposit / per application	52.00	
Rental		
Day	5.00	480
Lost or damaged hoods, keys, or locks		
Cost of repair or replacement	100%	
Administrative Fee	25.00	480
Parking, Administrative Penalties		
Immobilization boot removal fee	100.00	457
Semi-truck parked on public right of way in excess of time allowed	250.00	492
Parking, Miscellaneous Penalties * **		
Use of street for storage of vehicles / per violation	108.00	
Parking on Mall without permit / per violation	40.00	
Commercial vehicle parking on residential streets; vehicle parking overnight / per violation	108.00	
Failure to display Disabled Persons Placard/per violation	18.00	
No current vehicle registration	83.00	
No vehicle license plate	40.00	
Parked in Fire Lane	111.00	
Vehicle Inoperability/Immobilized	108.00	496
Parking, Overtime Penalties* **		
24 minute parking / per violation	33.00	
1 hour parking / per violation	33.00	
2 hour parking / per violation	33.00	
Parking overtime, meter zone / per violation	33.00	

* That \$3.00 increase per SB 857 will expire on July 1, 2013.

** Includes the following mandated items: \$3.00 County Court Construction, \$1.50 County Jail Construction, and \$3.00 Immediate and Critical Needs Construction Fund, \$2.00 State General Fund and \$3.00 Trial Court Trust Fund.

**CITY OF FRESNO
MASTER FEE SCHEDULE**

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT

PARKING FEES

<u>Fee Description & Unit/Time</u>	<u>Current</u>	<u>Amnd</u>
Parking, Downtown		480
On/off street meters		
30 minutes	0.30	
1 hour	0.75	
2 hours	1.50	
10-hour meter	0.75 per hr	
 Permit parking ("G," "E," and "F" Street lots) See rates under Parking Permits		
Monthly per vehicle		
Annually per vehicle	83.00	
 Residential Permit (non-refundable)		
Period 10/1 through 9/30		
First residential vehicle per homeowner/resident		
Annually per permit	-0-	
Additional vehicles		
Annually per permit	19.00	

Temporary Parking Discounts

Subject to prior approval by the Department Director and subject to limit of six months or less, special parking rates in Parking Maintenance District No. 1 may be allowed, if it is in the best interest of the City.

Public Works Department - Parking Services Division
Downtown Parking Contracts
As of 8/22/11

Uncovered Parking Rate \$75 per month Effective 7/1/11 per MFS

Covered Parking Rate \$90 per month Effective 7/1/11 per MFS

Contractor's Name	Date of Contract	Terms of Contract & Expiration Date	Number of Parking Stalls & Location	Current Contract Rate & Parking Revenues Received	Internal Auditor Comments
Club One	7/1/11	6/30/12	Garage #8 Underground - 100 Parking Stalls	100 parking stalls for a flat rate of \$6,000 per month (\$60 per stall); \$72,000 yearly (Paid to ACE then deposited to City's Bank)	Contract recently amended to extend it additional year
Judicial Council of CA Administrative Office of the Court	6/1/10	6/30/12	Stadium Parking Lot - 240 Parking Stalls	240 parking stalls @ \$33 per stall; \$95,040 yearly (Paid directly to City)	Contract in process of being amended
Fresno County Office of Education (FCOE)	5/28/93	5/28/23	Garage #8 Underground - 100 Parking Stalls	169 parking stalls @ \$40 per stall; \$81,120 yearly (Paid to ACE then deposited to City's Bank)	Contract in process of being amended
Housing Authority	5/21/93	5/20/23	Garage #9 - 26 Parking Stalls	26 parking stalls @ \$21.33 per stall; \$6,655 yearly (Paid directly to City)	No change in process
Small Business Administration (SBA)	12/9/10	12/8/20	Promenade Lot	108 parking stalls @ \$30 per stall; \$38,800 yearly (Paid to ACE then deposited to City's Bank)	No change in process
Fresno County Employees	6/30/10	6/30/12	Convention Center Garage - other garages as needed	233 parking stalls @ \$35 per stall; \$97,860 yearly (Paid directly to City)	Contract extended additional year
IRS Employees	2/2/04	3/31/2012	Boxcar Lot	100 parking stalls @ \$35 per stall; \$42,000 yearly (Paid directly to City)	Recently exercised Option Period Three of Contract
Federal Courthouse Employees	no contract	no contract	Convention Center Garage	69 parking stalls @ \$60 per stall; \$49,680 yearly (Paid to ACE then deposited to City's Bank)	Contract should be developed and executed between the IRS and City for parking
Total Annual Parking Revenue				\$483,155	

Prepared by Bob Koury, Internal Audit, City of Fresno - DRAFT/CONFIDENTIAL